

ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

- - -

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio	-	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	-	Vice President, District 7
Samuel DeMarco, III	-	Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker	-	District 1
Cindy Kirk	-	District 2
Edward Kress	-	District 3
Michael J. Finnerty	-	District 4
Sue Means	-	District 5
John F. Palmiere	-	District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni	-	District 8
Robert J. Macey	-	District 9
DeWitt Walton	-	District 10
Paul Klein	-	District 11
James Ellenbogen	-	District 12
Denise Ranalli Russell	-	District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, January 19, 2016 - 5:02 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain	-	Allegheny County Manager
Joseph Catanese	-	Director of Constituent Services
Jared Barker	-	Director of Legislative Services
Walter Szymanski	-	Budget Director
Jack Cambest	-	Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection.

(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

(Moment of Silent Prayer or Reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Have the roll call.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. CATANESE: Fifteen (15) members currently present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next what I'd like to do is we have people here from the Government Reform Committee, and they have to leave real early so I'd like at this time, unless there's a lot of objections, to have Mark Foerster --- I think there's --- two of them are going to come up and speak at this time. So is there any objections to that from anyone?

MR. FINNERTY: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Mark, at this time, would you guys like to come up?

MS. OLIPHANT: Thank you so much. Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Mr. President. My name is Aradhna Oliphant, and I am the vice chair of the GRC.

MR. SCHWARTZ: Rick Schwartz, one of the members of the Government Review Commission.

MR. FOERSTER: And I'm Mark Foerster of the Government Review Commission also. I want to extend an invitation to all the members of Council to the public hearing that we're going to hold on the 21st which is this Thursday at 6:00 o'clock here in the Gold Room. And also invite the public to attend. And our report is winding down. We're at the stage where we have our draft recommendations to the public which will be for consideration at the public hearing. And we anticipate a good turnout and are hopeful of a lot of questions and input from the public and of course from County Council.

You would be proud of the work that we've done to this point as far as the time that's been put in. Every Commission member has sacrificed a tremendous amount of time into this project. And I think you'll be proud of the work effort that has gone into it.

In addition to that, we will be deliberating the final recommendations on the 26th at 8:00 a.m. --- 8:30 a.m. in the Conference Room 1. And then our report will be to the people of Allegheny County sometime in March, and hopefully you'll have us to your meeting, one of your meetings in March for our final report.

So unless there's anything Aradhna would like to add or Rick ---.

MS. OLIPHANT: Mark has led an excellent, excellent process over the last, gosh, seven months or so. And we have put a lot of hard work, but this is a public hearing. This is about governance of the entire County. If you all are not there and if you all don't invite your constituents to come and hear these recommendations, then it'll be no transparency in government again. So at the very least each one of you should be there and maybe get at least three members from your district there. Can we please make sure that there is diversity in the people that you bring with you? Can we request that of you? Thank you so much. I think we'll have 15 times three at least.

MR. SCHWARTZ: On your desk is the first draft of the recommendations. And they're published on the website right now, the County website. So look them over. There are some that have to do with County Council. But I think you have to realize that pretty much any of these recommendations will require some type of Council action, whether it be a change in the Administrative Code, or whether it be a Charter action or whether it be something else. So we've gotten a lot of good input from Council members, and I hope you look at these and I hope the public looks at them and I hope to see a few of you here on Thursday night. Thanks.

MR. FOERSTER: Thank you very much for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9368-16.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation congratulating the Big Brothers Big Sisters of Greater Pittsburgh 6th Annual Celebrate Coalitions Awardees and thanking outgoing President Alyssa DiLoreto and Vice-President Justin Matase of the Young Professionals Outreach Board and Chairman of the BIG Recruitment Board, Doug Foster, for their dedicated service to Big Brothers Big Sisters of Greater Pittsburgh. Sponsored by Council Member Baker.

MR. BAKER: Thank you, Joe. Thank you, Mr. President. If I could have the honorees come up and all of our team here from Big Brothers Big Sisters? As they're coming up, I'll have to make sure that I also get my purple sticker on for I'm a BIG, so I can match you guys.

These are six of the finest young professionals we have in the region, and I'm really proud to have them here with us tonight. They are for a couple of different reasons. As Joe --- hey, high five. That's right, James. As Joe just mentioned Alyssa DiLoreto is winding down her two years as the president of our Young Professional Board and did an incredible job over the last two years leading that group, raising a lot of good money, getting the word out and just planning some incredible events for our organization.

Doug Foster is wrapping up his two years as the Chair of our BIG Recruitment Board. As our organization, our number one need is always more BIGs. And especially

men to get involved in our program. And Doug and our BRB Team spend their Friday nights, their Saturday mornings with Annie Cunningham and I really getting the word out on a grass roots level. We don't buy billboards. We really invest in a ground game where we spend time where people are, just talking to people about enrolling their children 6 to 13 years old and getting volunteers involved.

The one thing I would just mention before we introduce these terrific six folks is that this was the 50th anniversary of Big Brothers Big Sisters this last year. It was a record-breaking year for our organization. Last year we served 1,311 children in the community, and we found out on January 1st of this year that we served exactly --- exactly 1,400 children. You can't fudge the numbers. It's exactly ---. So if any of the seven of us, Molly Boren, if people wouldn't have got involved with Big Brothers Big Sisters, we would have been under 1,400. So it's a great team effort. We're so thankful to our volunteers, our coalition members and with that, we'll get to the Proclamation and then we'll have everyone say a quick word.

WHEREAS, each year Big Brothers Big Sisters of Greater Pittsburgh presents to deserving members of the local team the Coalition of the Year Award recognizing the importance of teamwork and cooperation.

WHEREAS, in recognition of their praiseworthy work furthering the charitable mission and goals of Big Brothers Big Sisters the awards were presented two weeks ago. Bobby Thompson is the YPO Member of the Year. Lauren Scheib is here. She's the BRB member of the Year. Abby Stark is the Washington County Board Member of the Year. James Doyle from the Pittsburgh Public Schools is the Youth Outcome Advisory Board Member of the Year. Scott Kerber from the Alumni Association, First Waves and Strong and Strong (sic) Girls were our community partners for the year.

WHEREAS, Big Brothers Big Sisters also recognizes the tremendous efforts of outgoing YPO president Alyssa DiLoreto, Vice President Justin Matase, and of course, Doug Foster, Chairman of the BIG Recruitment Board.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Allegheny County Council does hereby congratulate the 2015 Coalition Year Award Winners. And we thank Alyssa DiLoreto, Justin Matase and Doug Foster for their

dedicated service to Big Brothers Big Sisters of Greater Pittsburgh. Sponsored by myself and presented this 19th day of January 2016.

If we can give a big round of applause to our honorees?

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: We'll start with James Doyle, our YOAB Member of the Year from the Pittsburgh Public Schools.

MR. DOYLE: Greetings. Good evening. Happy end of Tuesday. Thank you so much, Tom, and all the members of Council for allowing us to come here and just bask in the wonderfulness of Big Brothers Big Sisters, and it's --- ultimately I'm honored to be able to support such a great organization. So as Tom mentioned, I work with Pittsburgh Public Schools, and I have the pleasure of really overseeing all of our district partnerships as it relates to out-of-school time opportunities.

So Big Brother and Big Sisters being one of our wonderful partners, I get to be a mentor to a seventh grader at Pittsburgh South Hills. I used to mentor with Tom over at Brookline. And it's just the most rewarding time of the week for me. So any time that I can spend with some of our young people, I'm really, really happy and proud to do it. So thank you so much for Tom and Big Brothers Big Sisters, for the great work that you guys do. Thanks.

(Applause.)

MS. DILORETO: I just want to say thank you to Tom, and thank you to all of the Council members. I've been a BIG for five years. It'll be going on six years this summer, and she really brings a whole lot of joy to my life. She is a student at Obama, and she lives in Mount Oliver. And she's been a huge blessing to my life, as the whole organization has been. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. FOSTER: We'd like to thank the County members for --- or I'm sorry, the Council members for having us here this evening. I very much appreciate your time. I'd think we'd all be remiss if we didn't highlight the work that Tom, Annie and the rest of the staff at Big Brothers Big Sisters does. They were organization, BBBS's organization of the Year and they really are an asset to Allegheny County and everyone that lives in western Pennsylvania.

I'd also like to thank you. My little brother and I, I'm sure, have spent time in each different district as we've taken advantage of all the different public works and opportunities. And so there's so much that can be given to matches and Big Brothers and Little Brothers and Little Sisters and Big Sisters through the work that you all do. And any time there's an opportunity to speak or promote the cause or recruit volunteers in your district, we'd certainly appreciate your consideration so ---. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. SCHEIB: Hello. Thank you for having us here this evening. Thank you, Tom. Without you I would --- probably wouldn't have been involved with Big Brothers Big Sisters. My little and I be matched for six years. We met when she was shorter than me. She is now taller than I am. I'm literally watching her grow up. And she enriches my life, adds so much value to my life. You know, we go to Target together and shop, but we also do homework together. And she practices her clarinet in front of me. So it's exciting and it's fun. And having been a part of such a wonderful board of other young professionals for the past two years, it's just added something to my life I never thought I would get. It's a wonderful group of people who --- we work together. We have fun together. And we organize events to get more awareness for Big Brothers Big Sisters and the amazing work that they do for the kids in Pittsburgh. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. CUNNINGHAM: Hi. I'm Annie Cunningham. I'm actually an employee/volunteer with Big Brothers Big Sisters. I also work with Tom, like he said, very closely on our recruiting efforts, making sure that we're getting our volunteers and kids involved. And it's just an amazing opportunity for our Coalitions to join us. And we're always --- we always feel honored by their presence because they could be anywhere else, but they choose to volunteer and spend their time with us as a staff and also with the youth that we help to serve. So just thank you all for acknowledging our efforts as a staff, but then also our efforts as a collective team. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. STARK: I was the last one. There's not much more I can say. But I'd like to reinitiate everything that these fine people have said. Thank you to

you guys. Thank you to Councilman Baker. So we are calling Councilman ---. But I've been --- I've worked at BBSS part time when I was in school, and that was about five years ago, I think. And then I've been a BIG for almost two years. And I can say that from both perspectives, as a staff and as a mentor, it's a life changing event that all of you should be interested in considering. I represent the Washington County and Greene County portion of BBSS. And we're always looking for BIGs there. And my little Brittany and I have a great time with BBSS. And yeah, thank you, guys.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. BAKER: Thank you. Thanks again. And this is National Mentoring Month so I would just encourage everyone here, all my --- the other 14 Council members and everyone in the crowd to think about just thanking somebody that mentored you when you were growing up, maybe when you were 6 to 13 years old, somebody, a coach, a teacher, a family member, somebody that you looked up to. This is National Mentor Month so please make sure to pay it forward and do more to mentor our young children here in our community. But also thank those that helped guide all of us to sit where we are tonight, so one more big round of applause for our honorees.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9369-16.

MR. CATANESE: Proclamation recognizing RideACTA's, Airport Corridor Transportation Association, record breaking service to the Airport Corridor in 2015. Sponsored by Council Members Baker, Finnerty and DeMarco.

MR. BAKER: All right. Councilmen DeMarco, Finnerty and I are going to ask Lynn Manion to come up. She's the executive director of RideACTA. And Lynn has some special news to share here tonight. Some of the staff related to RideACTA are really, really incredible. Councilman Finnerty and Councilman DeMarco and I are really honored to get to represent the area that Lynn and her team work with.

And just a couple of the statistics that should be mentioned. Lynn's team helped with over 88,000 rides last year, 88,897 rides. This is the --- last year was the 25th year of RideACTA? Right. And there's 200 different jobsites that RideACTA goes to, 300 rides a day. And if we just look at it from a consumption perspective,

having RideACTA here in our community saved 120,000 gallons of gas over the course of the year and removed 44,000 cars from being on the road.

So the work that RideACTA does is really tremendous. I know Councilman Finnerty and I have been at some of the events with RideACTA and with Lynn and Councilman DeMarco represents the airport area and the whole County, and we feel really fortunate for the work that Lynn and her team are doing. Do you want to say a few words or ---?

MR. FINNERTY: For Lynn, for sure. Well, I'd just like to really thank you, Lynn, for all the hard work you do and your group out there. You really move a lot of people around and get people to school and to work, and I think it's tremendous. You do a tremendous job.

MS. MANION: Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: We thank you.

MR. DEMARCO: I would just like to echo what Councilman Baker and Councilman Finnerty said, Lynn, in thanking you and your organization for the tremendous work that you do. And it's just not about what the organization does, but really we need to think about the people that you're actually helping. You know, every person that you give a ride to, how you help make their day and help them get through the day is something that's very important that we should all appreciate. Thank you again from the bottom of our hearts.

MR. BAKER: And we'll read the Proclamation and then we'll turn it over to Lynn to say a couple of words about all the good things going on with RideACTA.

WHEREAS, the Airport Corridor Transportation Association is a nonprofit transportation association incorporated in 1990 to increase travel options and support responsible economic development around the Robinson Town Center, the ten miles area west of downtown Pittsburgh.

AND WHEREAS, RideACTA, established in 2009 and operated by ACTA, demands responsive shuttle service throughout the region. It gets over 200 employers, businesses and training centers, complementing the Port Authority's Transit Services in the area.

WHEREAS, in addition to the --- its demand responsive shuttle services, RideACTA incorporates marketing and outreach strategies designed to connect job seekers with area employment opportunities and to create a

mutual understanding of the benefit of reliable and affordable public transportation in recruiting and retaining employees to support a strong and vibrant business community.

Is that your mission? That's a good mission. If not, Stephanie just wrote that. We should steal that. That's a very good mission.

AND WHEREAS, in 2015, RideACTA realized an increased ridership of 45 percent which is amazing over 2014, with 88,897 rides provided to passengers.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Allegheny County Council does hereby commend the Airport Corridor Transportation Association and RideACTA for its dedication to supporting and implementing programs that increase travel options and foster responsible economic growth in Pittsburgh's airport corridor. Sponsored by myself, Councilman Finnerty and Councilman DeMarco and presented this 19th day of January 2016.

Give a big round of applause to Lynn Manion from RideACTA.

(Applause.)

MS. MANION: Well, I think that they already told you everything about RideACTA so I don't have too much more to say. I will just mention if you've traveled out in the Airport Corridor over the last year or so, and you were at Ikea, you might have seen the new, what we call, super-stop, multimodal bus shelter which serves buses, people who walk, people who bike. And that was a project that we also did. That was our first construction project. So it just gives people a better, more comfortable place to wait for the trains between the ---. We serve last mile service so our riders are coming from Port Authority buses and getting on that last mile they travel on RideACTA. So if you haven't seen the new super-stop, I hope that you will take a look at it the next time you're out in the area.

So I think that's about it. The only other thing, I would certainly be remiss if I did not say thank you. Thank you, thank you, very much to all of you for Allegheny County's support of RideACTA. Most of our funding does come from PennDOT, but we do have a local match. And without you and the generosity of Allegheny County, we would not be able to operate the RideACTA service. So thank you for that. And it's a pleasure being here and meeting all of you.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9370-16.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Recognition awarded to the Allegheny County Department of Facilities Management for helping Allegheny County earn the Top Performer, Large Municipal Government, and Top Waste Reducer Awards in the 2014-2015 Green Workplace Challenge. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means and Palmiere.

MR. FINNERTY: All right. I'd like Kathy Hrabovsky --- yeah, over there she is. All right. Doug, we're going to bring you all up here, Al, Jim. Is Jim here? Oh, they didn't come.

This certificate is being awarded because of the way that they have taken the waste reduction, they've done waste reduction and got the Waste Reduction Award. This is some Green workplace Challenge that you people have succeeded in winning. And we're extremely, extremely pleased to honor some people from Allegheny County. It makes our hearts flutter. So without further ado --- unless you want to say some a few words, Mr. Macey.

MR. MACEY: Yeah. Thank you. Being chairman of Public Works, I'm very proud of the awards that Public Works as well as Facilities Management get because they're doing more with less. They are a great bunch of people. They work hard, and they're saving you taxpayers many, many dollars through their energy conservation. Thank you.

MR. FINNERTY: I'm going to read the Proclamation and then we'll have a few words from our esteemed people that are here.

This Certificate of Recognition is awarded to the Allegheny County Department of Facilities Management for helping Allegheny County earn the top performer award in the large municipal government category and the top waste reduction award in the 2014 and 2015 Pittsburgh Green Workplace Challenge.

The Department of Facility Management helped to reduce landfill waste by 62 percent in the County Office Building and the Allegheny County Health Department Administration Building.

The Green Workplace Challenge is a program of sustainable Pittsburgh and its business network.

Champions for Sustainability. The award cumulates the end of a yearlong friendly competition for businesses, nonprofits, municipalities and universities to track and measure improvements in energy, water, waste and transportation. From October 2014 to October 2015 approximately 50 employees throughout the southwest Pennsylvania, southwestern Pennsylvania, were active participants in the competition.

This Council recognizes the Allegheny County Department of Facility Management and the team effort that helped our County earn the top performer and top waste reduction awards in the 2014 and 2015 Pittsburgh Green Workplace Challenge.

And we thank you for working together to make our region --- and a better place for all. And this is sponsored by myself, and all members of County Council on this 19th day of January 2016.

So thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: Kathy, do you want to say ---? Kathy, want to say a few words?

MS. HRABOVSKY: I'll be very brief. Thank you, Councilman Finnerty and Councilman Baker. Or I'm sorry, Councilman Macey, for this honor. I'm here tonight with my director, Doug Nolfi. And I humbly accept this Certificate for all of the employees and staff members in the Department of Facilities Management.

This is truly a team effort. And we couldn't do it without the help of all of our trades people and all of our maintenance staff, particularly in the area of waste reduction as you can imagine. Not only our staff, but all of the members, all the employees of at least, the two buildings that we worked on for waste reduction so far, the County office building and ACHD admin building, have worked tirelessly to adapt to new types of waste collection. So we need to thank all the employees and all of the managers and directors in those buildings as well.

As the County Executive has often stated, Allegheny County is committed to advancing the cause of sustainability in many ways. So we want to reduce the effects of climate change particularly working in the energy, water and waste sectors. And it's great to have the support of the County Council in that effort, as well along with the County Executive and our County Manager and all of our directors. So thank you again.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: Do you want to say a few words?

MR. NOLFI: I just wanted to thank all the Council for this recognition and also it's --- it was involvement of everybody in the County that got involved in the buildings, but it was really spearheaded by Kathy who really does a very good job with what she does. Thank you.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9371-16.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Recognition congratulating the Allegheny County Department of Public Works for earning the Outstanding Highway Engineering Award by the American Association of Highway Engineers. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, Macey, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kress, Martoni, Means, Palmiere.

MR. MACEY: Well, good afternoon again. And I can say I'm still proud of Public Works. Would Steve Shanley, Mike Dillon and Gina Fisher, please come up? Look at that.

As I said before and I'll say again, we can be very proud of Public Works for all the work that they do. Many of the jobs that they do in our County are on budget or under budget, on time or ahead of schedule. They do a great job. And as I said before, they're doing it with less, usually less money and usually less personnel. But they're doing a fantastic job, the Allegheny County Department of Public Works.

This Certificate of Recognition is awarded to the Allegheny County Department of Public Works for earning the 2015 Outstanding Highway Engineering Award from the American Society of Highway Engineers. Project manager Gina Fisher led the team who's preservation project on Chartiers Creek, Bridge Number Six which carries Carothers Avenue, 3rd Street over Chartiers Creek between Scott Township and Carnegie Borough won the award for projects under \$5 million.

The bridge was built in 1927, and it is the longest Warren Truss in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania. The structure has been determined to be eligible for inclusion into the National Register of Historic Places.

The rehabilitation include repairing this steel, replacing sidewalks, repairing the deck, repainting the bridge and new lighting. The work is tied to the

Tri-Community Revitalization Project, a multi-municipal project involving Carnegie, Scott and Heidelberg. Funding for the \$1.6 million project came from the Pennsylvania Department of Transportation and the Federal Highway Agency and was completed by the Swank Construction Company of New Kensington on budget and ahead of schedule.

We congratulate the Allegheny County Department of Public Works for earning the 2015 Outstanding Highway Engineering Award from the American Society of Highway Engineers. And we thank the Public Works staff for working hard every day to create a sustainable County for future generations. And I'm sure this isn't the last award that will be coming our way. Sponsored by Allegheny County Council. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. MACEY: Steve Shanley.

MR. SHANLEY: I want to thank Councilman Finnerty, Councilman Macey, Council President and Council for all of their support on all our projects. We have a aggressive schedule coming up next year, and we just finished, completed an aggressive schedule this year. This project typifies what our Department does. It was a collaborative effort. Mike worked on the design. He's the deputy director now. He coordinated with Carnegie on the lightening for the structure. Gina was the project manager and the project turned out excellent. There were some bumps in the road. We've come up with some steel fabrication issues we had to deal with, but all in all it turned out to be a great project. So thank you for recognizing us for this project. Appreciate it.

(Applause.)

MR. MACEY: Gina? Mike? You're the awardee.

MR. FINNERTY: There's a picture of the bridge.

MS. FISHER: I thank you for this recognition of this bridge. It's a fine honor when you get to use your profession and help a community in their revitalization efforts. I've been a lifelong resident of Allegheny County, and I remember Carnegie when it was very downtrodden with losing its industry, and a lot of its businesses were closing on its Main Street. And this little bridge is now a gateway to that revitalization effort. And I'm very proud to be part of that. And I'd also --- and a project manager needs a team, and I'd like to mention that --- Swank Construction for their cooperation in meeting that deadline when we came into

some very hard challenges with that fabrication issue that Steve Shanley mentioned. And our onsite consultant, CDM Smith. And they were a great team to oversee and make sure that this project is now an award winner for the County. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. FINNERTY: I'd just like to mention one thing. The people of Carnegie and Scott think that's a fantastic, fantastic job. That bridge is great, especially the lights. Thank you.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9372-16.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Recognition awarded to the Allegheny County Office of Medical Examiner, Forensic Science Laboratory Division, Toxicology Section, for earning recertification from the Pennsylvania Department of Health in October 2015. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere.

MR. FINNERTY: This is Dr. Karl Williams and I don't know your name.

MS. JANSSEN: Jennifer.

MR. FINNERTY: And Jennifer, okay, from that Department, again, like I said, for the other departments it's really --- it's thrilling to honor our County Departments and County employees. So I'm just going to read the Proclamation and then, Doctor, I'll let you explain everything because I can't, to be very honest with you.

This Certificate of Recognition is awarded to the Allegheny County Office of Medical Examiner, Forensic Science Laboratory Division, Toxicology Section, for meeting the clinical, laboratory improvement amendments, the CLIA, conditions and level requirements and earning recertification in October 2015 from the Pennsylvania Department of Health.

The recertification signifies that the Toxic (Sic) Section has met recognized standards and demonstrated scientific excellence. Toxicology analyses are performed on blood and urine specimens submitted by law enforcement agencies to determine the presence of ethyl and other drugs that may modify human behavior.

Typically, the Toxicology Section processes 2,500 driving under the influence, DUI, cases each year. According to a recent study by the Forensic Science

Initiative at West Virginia University, the Allegheny County Crime Lab is one of the best labs in the world.

We congratulate the Allegheny County Office of Medical Examiner, Forensic Science Laboratory, Toxicology Section, for earning recertification from the Pennsylvania Department of Health. And we thank this staff for providing a vital public service through the deliverance of high quality professional forensic and laboratory services to the citizens of Allegheny County. And this is sponsored by myself and all members of Allegheny County Council. Dr. Williams?

DR. WILLIAMS: You did very well with that. I've seen a lot more stumbling over some of these.

MR. FINNERTY: Oh, yeah.

DR. WILLIAMS: It's always a pleasure to come in front of County Council and acknowledge the support that you have for the laboratory in Allegheny County. I'm forced every time I come down to remind everybody that --- the fact that the crime laboratories of Allegheny County are under the same administration as the medical examiner is. It is truly unique in the United States. It may be one of the only facilities that --- quote, unquote, the destined investigations systems in the country where that happens. It allows my laboratories to do things that can't be done anywhere else, and I'll give you just one example. Since I see all of the seized drugs that come in as well as seeing what's killing the people, I'm able to almost provide the DEA, divide (sic) the police with online information about what's happening. It's the infrastructure of having them all together which is really critical.

Now, without infrastructure is one thing. Having the crime scene investigation and the death investigation tied together with one laboratory information system is a very powerful tool, but that infrastructure doesn't really mean anything without people in the structure that are operating, that are managing it. And Jennifer Janssen, the head of the Toxicology Section, is one of those people that is absolutely essential to the operation of the office.

Remember, we're right now in what is probably the greatest mini-epidemic in America of drug overdoses. There was just an announcement from the CDC that the whole statistics of why in particular white males are dying is changing over the last years because of what we're going

through with the drug overdose crisis. It's having managers like Jennifer and parts of the toxicology division that allows us to get the numbers, to get the data. Everything is based on the evidence. Everything is based on having a good solid set of data to look at what's happening because it happens at the local level. What's happening in Allegheny County is not what's happening in Westmoreland County. It's not what's happening in Erie. It's having the local experience as up to date at all times as we can that makes a difference.

So I'll accept this award. I want Jennifer to say just a few words. She's not the most loquacious person on the face of the earth, but she's an example of the managers of my section working together, that I'm able to pull together all the efforts and turn this office into what is really one of the best in the country, I feel. Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

MS. JANSSEN: Thank you very much for this honor. And I want to thank Dr. Williams and our lab director, Bob Huston, as well as the seven scientists who work in the toxicology section, who day in and day out do all the hard work. And as Dr. Williams stated, we do --- actually we did 3,500 DUI cases last year. And we also did about 1,200 post mortem cases where we did all of the toxicology work. And I want to give the credit to the scientists who did the work. Thank you.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9373-16.

MR. CATANESE: Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mary Esther Van Shura for earning the 2015 Charles W. Pruitt Jr. Award of Excellence by the Southwestern Pennsylvania Partnership for Aging. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, DeMarco.

MR. FINNERTY: Mary Esther, would you please come forward? If you have a problem in Allegheny County in relation to aging, this is the lady to see. She knows it all, without a doubt, and has done great work for Allegheny County, it seems like since I've been here. Probably a lot longer than that, but since I've been here.

All right. And we really do appreciate that, and it really makes us feel great that we got an award for

you here. And that's really great. So let me read the award and the certificate and you can say a few words.

This Certificate of Recognition is award to Mary Esther Van Shura, the Director of Community Affairs in the County Executive office, for earning the 2015 Charles W. Pruitt, Jr. Award of Excellence from the Southwest Pennsylvania Partnership for Aging. The award recognizes the outstanding efforts in the field of aging which has a regional, state or national impact. Mary Esther was recognized for her lifetime commitment to the betterment of life of seniors and people with disabilities in so many important ways. Her nomination also lauded her for having been critical in promoting the cause and needs of seniors and persons with disabilities in all levels of government.

Mary Esther was honored on December 2nd, 2015 at the Southwest Pennsylvania Partnership for Aging's annual meeting. This Council commends Mary Esther for earning the 2015 Charles W. Pruitt, Jr. Award of Excellence, and we thank you for your outstanding contributions to the field of aging and our people in Allegheny County.

Sponsored by myself and all members of Council on the 19th day of January 2016. Mary Esther.

(Applause.)

MS. VAN SHURA: Thank you, Councilman Finnerty and all members of Council. I could not help but reflect this morning, as a child I asked my grandmother, my Nona, what gave you the courage to come to America? And she said it was not courage. It was the pursuit of freedom. And we are all charged with pursuing freedom. Admittedly, I did not know the words of my grandmother. I didn't know the beauty or the burden of that charge. But tonight, this recognition, I'm humbled by it because what it really does is County Council is affirming their commitment to the Older Americans' Act, the 50th year that just was passed just a few months ago, in which we said that no older adult in this County will have poverty of person or poverty of purse. And likewise, the Americans for Disability Act 25 years ago said all individuals in this County with disabilities will not be referenced by their disability, but be acknowledged for their abilities.

I thank you for this honor, and I'm very honored to have received the Charlie Pruitt. For those of you that knew Charlie Pruitt, he's a legend in this Commonwealth. He understood what common mission, common vision, common purpose was. And the Southwestern

Pennsylvania Partnership for Aging, for those of you who have not had that exposure to that group, it's a ten county coalition, 300 members that are fiercely committed.

I thank you for this honor and thank you, Councilman. And I look forward to working with all of you in the future. As Councilman, as Executive Fitzgerald said in his swearing in, no man can step in the same river twice. It is our responsibility to look differently, to think creatively and respond to the needs of the older adults and those with individuals with disabilities in our County. Thank you so much for this honor.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9374-16 will be held for a later date. There was a mix-up there. 9375-16, and the rest will be read into the record.

MR. CATANESE: Certificates of Achievement awarded to Ms. Tori Ligus, Ms. Hannah Sciulli and Ms. Katie Snyder of Girl Scout Troop 50146 for earning Silver Awards. Sponsored by Council Members Baker and Kirk.

9376-16. Certificates of Achievement awarded to Mr. Samuel Miller, Jr., Mr. Peter Poplos, Mr. Brandon Ferruzza and Mr. Jarrett Parker of Boy Scout Troop 248 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty and Baker.

9377-16. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Mr. Noah Heinrich of Boy Scout Troop 248 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9378-16. Proclamation thanking the Honorable Nino Petrocelli, Sr. for his 30 years of dedicated service to Bridgeville Borough. Sponsored by Council Members Finnerty and Means.

9379-16. Proclamation thanking the Honorable John Ciangiarulo, Jr. for his 24 years of dedicated service to the McKees Rocks Borough. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9380-16. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mr. Joseph Rogowski upon the occasion of his 102nd birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

9381-16. Proclamation congratulating the Honorable Kevin Larkin for his dedicated service to Verona Borough. Sponsored by Council Member Futules.

9382-16. Proclamation thanking the Honorable Bart E. Bodkin for his dedicated service to O'Hara Township. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

9383-16. Certificate of Recognition thanking Reserve Township Police Chief Frederick G. Boory, Jr. for his dedicated service upon the occasion of his retirement. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

9384-16. Proclamation thanking Mr. Cliff Flegal for his 50 years as the master of ceremonies for the City of McKeesport's Pearl Harbor commemoration. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9385-16. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. William and Karen Badstibner upon the occasion of their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9386-16. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. Joseph and Suzanne Foster upon the occasion of their 50th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

9387-16. Proclamation honoring the memory of the late Jane Grey Swisshelm upon the occasion of her 200th birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Martoni.

9388-16. Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mr. George Kohler upon the occasion of his 100th birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

9389-16. Certificates of Achievement awarded to the St. Gabriel boys' varsity cross country team for winning the 2015 Pittsburgh Diocesan boys' varsity cross country team championship. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

9390-16. Proclamation recognizing the 18th Annual Summit Against Racism and declaring Saturday, January 23rd, 2016, to be Black and White Reunion Day in Allegheny County. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment, we don't have any. Approval of Minutes. 9351-16.

MR. CATANESE: Motion to approve the minutes of the December 15th, 2015 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

MR. KLEIN: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
9332-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Allison Burgan to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization, Hartwood Acres Park, for a term to expire in January 19th, 2018. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you want to say anything?

MR. KRESS: No. I'm just saying I'm proud to reappoint Allison Burgan. I mean, we have a great committee or great Friends. It's a group over at Hartwood Acres. I mean, I think they do a stellar job. And I'm glad to see she wants to serve again, because again, these are all volunteer positions. So they spend a lot of time, and I really do appreciate her time in trying to improve Hartwood Acres for the people of my community. So I'd like to make a motion.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
9333-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Joe Downing to serve as a member of the Council of Friends organization, Hartwood Acres Park, for a term to expire on January 19th, 2018. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do you want to say anything?

MR. KRESS: Sure. I'd just like to say the same thing about Joe Downing. He does a great job for the people in the area trying to improve Hartwood Acres. And I'd like to make a motion to reappoint.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
9349-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Tonya B. Johnson to serve as a member of the Accountability, Conduct and Ethics Commission for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9350-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of DeWitt Walton to serve as a member of the Allegheny County

Vacant Property Review Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9350-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment of DeWitt Walton to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Vacant Property Review Committee for a term to expire on December 31st, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9353-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Robert J. Lewis to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Airport Authority for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9354-15.

MR. CATANESE: Sixteen (16).

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sixteen (16).

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Derek Uber to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Housing Authority for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go into the Appointment Review Committee. 9355-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of M. Gayle Moss to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Jail Oversight Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Appointment Review Committee. 9356-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Doris Carson Williams to serve as a member of the Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County for a term to expire on May 23rd, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The next group will be in a block. It's 9357-16 all the way down to 9361-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the appointment --- or reappointment of Ayanna Lee-Davis, Esquire, William Cagney, Mary Ann Eisenreich, Kevin Kinross, Esquire and Frederick Thieman, Esquire, to serve on the Community College of Allegheny County Board of Trustees for a term to expire on December 31st, 2021 with Ms. Ayanna Lee-Davis, Esquire to expire on April 24th, 2021. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Appointment Review Committee. 9362-16 and 9363-16, we'll get them in a block, too.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Thomas Donatelli and John L. Tague to serve as members of the Port Authority of Allegheny County for a term to expire on September 17th, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Appointment Review Committee. 9364-16 going down to 9367-16.

MR. CATANESE: Approving the reappointment of Jackie Dixon, Daniel Griffin, Dusty Kirk, Esquire and Anthony J. Ross to serve as members of the Allegheny Regional Asset District Board for a term to expire on December 31st, 2016. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Appointment Review Committee. Unfinished Business, we don't have any. Liaison Reports. Anyone have a liaison report? Seeing none, we'll move on. New Business, Ordinances and Resolutions. 9391-16.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing the continued use of the house on Chipmunk Drive in the County's Harrison Hills Park as an Environmental Learning Center by the Friends of Harrison Hills Park. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Parks Committee. 9392-16.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance authorizing the Department of Public Works to take certain actions on behalf of the County Council with respect to the issuance of highway occupancy permits, the grant of certain licenses, rights of entry and easements and the amicable acquisition of certain real estate affecting County public work projects and other matters for calendar years 2016 and 2017. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Public Works Committee. 9393-16.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing the use of real property in the County's South Park by the United States Table Tennis Association, d/b/a USA Table Tennis and the South Park Table Tennis Club. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to the Parks Committee. 9394-16.

MR. CATANESE: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to acquire by condemnation certain right-of-way and easement areas from two parcels required to realign Thoms Run Road, also known as Thoms Run-Oakdale Road in Collier Township, 6306-0201, and to take such further action as by be necessary under applicable law, including the Eminent Domain Code. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Public Works Committee. 9395-16.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution approving a Project for the benefit of Rebecca Residence, the Borrower, and its affiliates; Concordia of Monroeville, Concordia Lutheran Health and Human Care, Concordia Lutheran Ministries Foundation, Concordia of Ohio and Concordia Lutheran Ministries of Pittsburgh to be financed by the Allegheny County Hospital Development Authority by the issuance of the Authority's tax-exempt bonds, to be issued in one or more series, in the aggregate principal amount not expected to exceed \$45,000,000 provided that the taxing power of the County of Allegheny, Pennsylvania, the County, shall not be obligated in a way with respect to the Bonds hereinafter defined, and determining that the purpose of the financing will be to benefit the health and welfare of the citizens of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Budget and Finance. 9396 ---.

MR. FUTULES: No, Economic Development.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, I'm sorry. It is. You're right. What did I say, Budget ---? That was 93 --- did you just read 9395?

MR. CATANESE: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9396-16.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, PA Statute, Title 72, Section 4722 et seq, 1995, as amended providing for; a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County Real Property Taxes, for a specific time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within Ward 5, the East Liberty neighborhood within the City of Pittsburgh, County

of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into the Economic Development Committee. 9397-16.

MR. CATANESE: A Resolution of the Council of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania, made pursuant to the Local Economic Revitalization Tax Assistance Act, LERTA, PA Statute, Title 72, Section 4722, et seq, 1995, as amended, providing for; a program of temporary exemption from increases in Allegheny County Real Property Taxes, for specified time periods, resulting from improvements made by an owner of property located within Ward 2, the Strip District neighborhood within the City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, previously determined to be a deteriorated area; establishing a schedule for exempting increases in Allegheny County property taxes resulting from such improvements; and prescribing the requirements and procedures by which an owner of property located within the deteriorated area can secure the temporary exemption resulting from such improvements. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Economic Development Committee. New Business, Motions. Nick.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. FUTULES: At this time, I'd like to ask for an Exec Session.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's ---.

MR. FUTULES: The reason being the Executive Committee met last week and we have some staffing new on the agenda for our staff.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: At this time, we'd like to take a break to go into Executive Session on that issue. (Executive Session Held.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Nick, you want to ---?

MR. FUTULES: I'd like to make a motion to ratify the Executive Committee action.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

MR. FINNERTY: I'll second it.

MR. FUTULES: At this time we have an ordinance to pass out. No, I don't. What?

MR. FINNERTY: Got to vote on what we seconded.

MR. MACEY: It's back in the President's hands.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: First of all, you got three different issues; right?

MR. FUTULES: I do.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Then why don't you ---. You should bring up one at a time. All you said was ---.

MR. FUTULES: Well, I know, but Jared seemed to --- has it in writing, some sort of ordinance.

MR. BARKER: Yeah, that's my understanding.

MR. FUTULES: Yeah.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What's your understanding?

MR. BARKER: That Mr. Futules made a motion to ratify the actions of the Executive Committee from last Wednesday, I believe, and that got a second. He also has an ordinance to distribute, but that has to be added to the agenda before we even get to that point. Correct, Jack?

MR. CAMBEST: That's correct.

MR. BARKER: We're on the same page then.

MR. FUTULES: So I make a motion to add that to the agenda? No?

MR. CAMBEST: No.

MR. FUTULES: No?

MR. CAMBEST: Motion on the floor.

MR. FINNERTY: Motion on the floor.

MR. CAMBEST: Approve the Executive Session.

MR. FUTULES: Okay.

MR. FINNERTY: We have to approve that.

MR. FUTULES: So ---.

MR. CAMBEST: What Mr. Barker said there are three issues that have so we should take one at a time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One at a time. We don't know what we're voting on unless we explain it.

MR. CAMBEST: You don't need a motion to approve ---.

MR. FUTULES: The Chief of Staff. Okay. Need a motion, excuse me, to Chief ---.

MR. FINNERTY: What? We're withdrawing this? Are we withdrawing the motion that's on the floor?

MR. FUTULES: No.

MR. CAMBEST: Clarifying the motion.

MR. FINNERTY: Okay.

MR. FUTULES: I'm clarifying the motion. The motion is to make Joe Catanese the Chief of Staff.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to second it?

MR. FINNERTY: Second it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll try --- all those in favor signify by saying aye.
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Those opposed? The ayes have it.

MS. MEANS: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: One no.

MS. MEANS: One no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. If that's all there is, then we'll let it go at that. What's your second?

MR. FUTULES: My second one is backlash. I need to make a motion to give the cost of living increase to Joe Catanese that he was entitled to last year.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, I guess we could try a voice vote. All those in favor signify by saying aye.
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? okay. The ayes have it.

MR. FUTULES: I have another motion. The third motion to approve the cost of living increase to Jared Barker that was given to him last year as well.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? All those in favor signify by saying aye.
(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed?

MS. MEANS: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Any more? One no? Okay. That passes.

MR. FUTULES: That's all I have, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now, we get down to ---

MR. FUTULES: Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: --- 9398-16.

MR. CATANESE: Do we have to do an ordinance?

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. We have to do something in order to ---.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. I have a motion to present this ordinance.

MR. CAMBEST: Amend the agenda to pass this ordinance.

MR. FUTULES: Add it to the agenda.

MR. FINNERTY: No, I guess not. I don't know.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. This is the ordinance for the Chief of Staff. At this time I'd like to make a motion to waive the second reading.

MR. FINNERTY: You got to get it on the agenda first.

MR. FUTULES: I have to put it on the agenda.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah, make a motion.

MR. FUTULES: Make a motion to put it on the agenda ---

MR. FINNERTY: That's correct.

MR. FUTULES: --- first.

MR. FINNERTY: I'll second that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Under remarks. Go ahead.

MS. MEANS: I would just like to see this go to committee to be discussed and not waive the second reading.

MR. FUTULES: It was discussed at committee.

MR. CAMBEST: That would be separate. Why don't we make a vote and see if ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There's a motion.

MR. FUTULES: Votes.

MR. FINNERTY: It's a motion. And a second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's take the roll call.

MS. MEANS: What are we voting --- to waive the second reading or to put it on the agenda?

MR. FUTULES: Just to put it on the agenda.

MS. MEANS: Okay. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Just to put it on the agenda, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed?

MS. MEANS: No.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And no one else? One no? It passes.

MR. FUTULES: So now it's on the agenda. Now, I make a motion to waive the second reading.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: There's a second. Under remarks?

MR. KRESS: Hold it. I just have a quick question here. I mean, it says here County Council shall employ a County Council staff. Are we talking about a singular person? I mean, I just want to make sure I understand what we're voting on here. Section B.

MR. FUTULES: It should be staff member.

MR. KRESS: Employ a County Council staff, I mean, ---.

MR. FINNERTY: Either/or.

MR. KRESS: I'm just saying are we talking about --- I mean, I'm just wondering. Can you clarify that for me, please? That paragraph.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: It's what Joe decides.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Nick?

MR. FUTULES: I see what you're talking about. County Council shall employ a County Council staff to assist the Chief of Staff in all matters and things to be done and performed in the Office of County Council. In other words, the two directors also assist him. He's not the Lone Ranger. There's three directors, but Joe is the Chief of Staff, but the two directors will report to him as well.

MR. KRESS: I know. But I'm saying, ---

MR. FUTULES: That's what that means.

MR. KRESS: --- should it read County Council should employ County Council staff to assist the Chief of Staff? I'm just saying employ a County Council staff, I mean, what --- I don't understand.

MS. KIRK: It says discuss a ---.

MR. KRESS: I mean, I'm just saying there needs some clarification of the language.

MR. FUTULES: Well, I'm not an attorney.

MR. KRESS: Well, I'm not even going to say what I am. Okay? I heard it too much last time. Okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You could clear it up to make it so everybody understands.

MR. FUTULES: So what are you suggesting?

MR. KRESS: I'm just saying, I'm asking for clarification.

MR. FUTULES: To change the wording?

MR. KRESS: Well, I'm just saying ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All you have to do is a simple thing. All you have to do is spell out that the other two directors are going to assist. That's it.

MR. FUTULES: I don't think we can make an amendment to ---.

MR. KRESS: I'm just saying I was confused by the language.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. FINNERTY: I don't see anything wrong with it.

MR. FUTULES: Can I clarify what telling you what we're doing?

MR. DEMARCO: I think it's confusing from my perspective. When I look at B and I read this, it acts like or looks like it reads that he can hire additional employees solely to support him as opposed to just changing the actual organization chart here, and I think that's ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, that's what I said.

MR. DEMARCO: --- something to ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All you have to do --- I agree with you. That's why all you have to do is say have the other two directors assist him when needed.

MR. WALTON: Mr. President?

MR. BARKER: Doesn't it require a rewrite?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What?

MR. WALTON: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. WALTON: This does not read that the Chief of Staff has hiring authority. It says Council. There's a difference between spelling out Chief of Staff and Council. And I think that that clearly delineates the process. Now, if there's a concern regarding staffing in Item B, we can strike the word aid ---

MR. CAMBEST: That's right.

MR. WALTON: --- and it shall then read County Council shall employ --- County Council shall employ County Council staff, if that's the concern.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. That's really not the --- that's not the intent. The intent is to have --- the Chief of Staff when needed, he could use one of the two directors. Yeah. We're not looking to hire. Make it confusing. They're going to hire no one. All they're going to do is assist him if he needs assistance; right?

MR. WALTON: So that being the case ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. WALTON: Then that being the case, than the section should be rewritten ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. WALTON: --- to reflect that the Chief of Staff directs the staff of Council.

MR. FINNERTY: Well, he does.

MR. WALTON: If that being the case as was just said, then the issue is moot.

MR. FINNERTY: Yeah. Exactly.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Do we want to just add the words for here and correct it later? I mean, we're going to correct it here.

MR. KRESS: I was just going to say maybe just put it in committee and change it and then ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's a whole other issue. You're opening up another can of worms. We want to get it over with.

MR. FINNERTY: If I could say ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: --- a word or two here. I really don't see any problem with it. I mean, if you read it, it says County Council shall employ a County Council staff to assist the Chief of Staff in all matters and things to be done and performed in the office of County Council. Now, that's pretty straightforward.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Now that's ---.

MR. FINNERTY: He's saying --- if I can finish --- if it's possible, that if the person is Chief of Staff, he has --- how you say this? He has oversight of all staff members. That's why he's called the Chief of Staff. And that's what's its saying here, you know. And that's true. And then the next part of it is just County Council staff shall report to and be supervised by the Chief of Staff. Now, that's pretty straightforward. I mean, it's saying that he is over all the staff. That's what a Chief of Staff person is.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It's not clear, Mike. It's not clear. You're looking --- like some people look at this like he's going to employ somebody. We're not employing anyone.

MR. FINNERTY: It says County Council shall employ. It doesn't say he does.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Look, all we have to do is make it clear. The Chief of Staff can utilize the assistance of the other two directors when needed.

Simple. What you're saying --- everyone else --- everybody has a different opinion. That's crystal clear. Go ahead, Jim.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: All I want to say is we pay Jack to do this stuff. You know, Jack understands what the concept is. Allow Jack to put the language in that will give everyone what they need. That's what he gets paid to do; right? Now, we're going to sit up here and talk all night about it.

MR. FUTULES: Do we want to send this to committee or what?

MR. KRESS: Yes, please.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: He's darn good at it, too.

MR. FUTULES: Do you want to send it to committee?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It's up to you guys.

MR. FUTULES: All right. I think it's immaterial, but let's send this to committee ---

MR. FINNERTY: So it goes back to ---.

MR. FUTULES: --- so everybody is comfortable with the language.

MS. MEANS: Thank you.

MR. KRESS: Which committee?

MR. FINNERTY: Which committee?

MR. FUTULES: Mine. Executive committee.

MR. FINNERTY: Executive committee.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, that's where it goes. I'll make that decision. It ---.

MR. FUTULES: I think that might be the best solution because we've already ---. This is just ---.

MR. FINNERTY: I don't see any problem with it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: No. We're not going to do the same thing.

MR. FUTULES: Let's just send it to committee, and we'll reword it so everybody is comfortable with it.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I don't know why you don't just give it to Jack, and let him give you ---.

MS. MEANS: It's pretty vague, though.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: It's very, very, very simple. I mean, ---.

MR. FUTULES: If anybody wants to make an amendment, you can right now, but you have to be in writing.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're not trying to crack the atom here. All we're trying to do is say he's the Chief. He can use this guy or that guy, period.

MR. FUTULES: I get it. We've got Council members that aren't comfortable with it so it's up to you guys.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Do you want to send it to committee?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. FUTULES: I'll send it to committee.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're going to send it to the Executive Committee. Okay. Let's go with the next one. 9398-16.

MR. CATANESE: 9398-16. Motion of the Council of Allegheny County censuring Council Member Sue Means for conduct, specifically the introduction of a motion to approve the minutes of various committee meetings by the full Council at the December 15th, 2015 regular meeting contrary to the Rules of Council and past practices, and which directly leads to a breach of confidentiality regarding the unapproved minutes by Council Staff. Sponsored by Council Member Finnerty.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Finnerty.

MR. FINNERTY: Thank you. I'd like to read the censure motion in entirety, if that's all right with you, Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. FINNERTY: Censuring Council Member Sue Means for conduct, specifically the introduction of a motion to approve the minutes of various committee meetings by the full Council at the December 15th, 2015 regular meeting. This is contrary to the rules of Council and past practice which directly leads to a breach of confidentiality regarding the unapproved minutes by Council staff.

WHEREAS, Article II, Rule M8 of Council Rules permits the censuring of Council members by a motion.

AND WHEREAS, on December 25th, 2015, Council Member Sue Means introduced Bill Number 9330-15 entitled a motion to approve the minutes referenced within this motion comprising the committee meetings of Allegheny County Council for the 2014 and 2015 Council term which have not appeared on an agenda during the current term for approval.

AND WHEREAS, under the terms of Bill Number 9330-15, the minutes from 15 separate committee meetings involving ten of the Council's standing and special committees would have been approved by the full Council rather than by the Committees in question.

AND WHEREAS, this action, if undertaken, would have been unprecedented as the full Council has never in the past approved the minutes of any established committee.

AND WHEREAS, motions to approve committee minutes are assigned bill numbers and approved by motion and vote of the committee in question within the course of their respective meetings.

AND WHEREAS, approval of committee minutes by the full Council would therefore have removed a matter, the minute approval, from the jurisdiction of each of the committees in question in contravention of Article II, Rule F(3). The Rules of Council which provide that whenever legislation or other matters have been referred to a committee, the Chair shall have full power and control over such legislation or other matters except that such committee shall not change the subject. A committee shall not consider a bill or other matters which is not in its possession.

AND WHEREAS, on December --- I'm sorry.

WHEREAS, on December --- on Friday, December the 11th, 2015, and presumably at the request of Ms. Means, in support of 9330-15, Council staff forwarded copies of only 11 of the 15 unapproved committee minute meeting sets that were subject of 90 --- I think you got the wrong thing there --- of 9330-15, to all members of Council and other individuals, thus leaving the Council to vote on the other four sets without Ms. Means even having provided them for review.

AND WHEREAS, even more troubling and also presumably at the request of Ms. Means, Council staff forwarded at least four sets of the unapproved committee minutes, those covering the December 10th, 2015 meeting of the committee of Economic Development and Housing, and the January 30th, 2014 and September 16th, 2014 and December 3, 2015 meetings of the Special Committee on Marketing to individuals outside of the Office of County Council, including numerous employees of the Administration, row office and the news media.

AND WHEREAS, this public disclosure of unapproved committee meeting minutes constitutes a serious breach of protocol and confidentiality within the Office of County Council and should not have been requested by Ms. Means.

NOW, THEREFORE, it is moved by the Council of Allegheny that Council Member Sue Means is hereby censured by Allegheny County Council for conduct, specifically the introduction of a motion to approve the minutes of various committee meetings and by the full Council at the December 15th regular contrary to the rules of Council in past practice which directly leads to a breach of confidentiality regarding the unapproved minutes of Council staff.

And that is the censure motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Sue?

MS. MEANS: Thank you, Mr. President.

MR. FINNERTY: And I want to make a motion to approve it.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Go ahead, Sue.

MS. MEANS: Thank you, Mr. President, for recognizing me. First of all, I do not understand the motion to censure me. It appears that I am being censured for bringing forth an idea. We are legislators, and that is what we do. We legislate. I thought I had a good idea. I went through all the proper channels to place my idea on the agenda. The solicitor even approved it. I have an e-mail right here I'd like to enter into the record from Mr. Cambest saying --- let's see --- Lori, Sue and I talked to Walt this morning, and the legislation is approved as formed. Number one, the second e-mail I have from Mr. Cambest also surprised me, that on December 8th he told me that when he would proofread or review my legislation, he would make sure it was in proper form and not in violate --- and not in violation of the Home Rule Charter, state statute, federal statute, Administrative Code or the Rules of Council, so it can move forward by consideration of Council, Jack Cambest. Again, I have an e-mail. I want this entered into the record from Mr. Cambest saying ---.

So image my surprise when a Rule of Council is used to attack my legislation. And this also, Rule of Council is also cited in the censure motion. The Rule

cited, Article II, Rule F(3), a censure is not applicable to minutes or minutes of committee. This rule is applicable to the legislation or other matter referred to committee.

Now, when you write a rule or an ordinance, every word counts. Other matter referred to committee. The minutes are not referred to committee, and are in control of the clerk, not the chair. For example, if a member in the past had a request to amend the minutes, that request was given to the clerk who took minutes at that meeting. It was not referred to the Chair for the Chair to make the decision.

Furthermore, minutes are circulated to members by the staff as a matter of course when a --- meeting agendas are generated. The staff is not directed, nor has it ever been directed, to request from the Chair whether or not to place the minutes on the agenda. In other words, the minutes are always placed on the agenda.

On December 15th, my idea was placed on the agenda. It was discussed, and it was debated. The majority of Council was not in support of my motion. The motion failed. I can live with that. I do not believe I did anything wrong by placing it on the agenda. I think it would be very wrong to censure me for placing something on the agenda.

Now, thank you for giving me a few more moments. I want to read from the Rules of Council, Article II, Section M(9), Censure by County Council is a formal motion reprimanding a person for conduct that falls below the guidelines established in the Rules of Council requesting that minutes be approved during the last meeting of Council is not conduct that falls below the guidelines established by the Rules.

The section that is cited in the censure as a violation, that I am in violation, is ambiguous at best, with regard to approval of minutes. Matter does not clearly cover minutes because of --- minutes are not referred to committee. Arguably, it does not apply at all. When the rules are not clear, Robert's Rules are followed. Robert's states that minutes are in control of the recording officer of the body. A designed duty of the recording officer of the body is to make minutes and records available to the members on request --- Robert's Rules, 11th Edition, page 459. As this duty of minutes and distribution and minute approval of tracking has been

the duty nearly exclusively performed by Lori Sicard, it was properly within her duties to distribute the minutes at the request of Council Member Means, myself.

Furthermore, my motion is not censurable because the approval of minutes outstanding for a term as directed by Robert's Rules. So again, Robert's Rules say we're going to have a new Council. The old is gone. You know, new chairman, new committee members, so let's look at Robert's Rules on page 474. When, in an organization in which there will --- a change or replacement portion of the membership, the Executive Board or the committee appointed for that purpose should be authorized to approve the minutes.

And I did suggest that on December 15th, that you know that Executive Committee or there could be a committee to discuss appointment --- the President could appoint a special committee to approve these minutes. Because my motion was placed on the agenda for the last Council meeting of 2014-2015, it was not only proper, but necessary for the body to dispose of the remaining minutes of the term as no committee meetings would be held after that meeting. In fact, that's when I also suggested there were other ways to deal with it, so ---.

And I brought the minutes and I had hard copies of all the minutes on the 15th. I had sent the minutes ahead of time because I thought that Council members could put their heads together and say I was at this meeting, you were at that meeting. What do you think? Again, it was an idea to discuss and debate, and it failed. So I requested the minutes on December 11th to be sent to only Council members. It was an accident that four of those minutes were sent to a larger distribution list. It was an accident. And a staff member accidentally sent four minutes to a larger distribution list. She has admitted it. How many times have you went to e-mail somebody --- like Sam --- going to e-mail Sam DeMarco, I press in Sam, I push go and, whoops, it was Sam Smith, not Sam DeMarco. So none of us are perfect. And I like --- always like to show people that I show people mercy when they mess up because I might mess up some day, and I don't want that person yelling at me so I show people mercy whenever there is a mess up.

So thank you very much for allowing me to speak.

MR. FINNERTY: Could I say a few words?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah Go ahead.

MR. FINNERTY: First of all, if you looked at the Rules of Council, you would see that, and you keep quoting Robert's Rules. And it says in about the third paragraph that Robert's Rules of Order shall serve as the parliamentary authority for all procedures, and that are --- all procedures not expressly set forth in these rules. Robert's Rules do not apply here because there is stuff set forth in these rules in regard to committees, in regard to taking things out of committees, and myself or anyone else here does not have that power to move something out of a committee, whatever it is. If you want to move something out of committee you have to come before this full body and say, hey, I'd like to pull this from committee and put up a motion to do it. And then it has to be voted on. And depending on how many days it's been there, it's either ten or eight to pull it from committee.

Now, what has transpired here is things were pulled from committee without that happening, on one Council person's charge, pull this.

Now, this has never happened before. And I'm not saying --- and it hasn't happened before because it expressly says that, that it can't be done, that it has to go through a process to get it or else anybody can start taking things out of committee. To take unapproved minutes out and send them around is definitely wrong because there could be mistakes there. And that's why you have a meeting and you have the minutes there, and people approve or disapprove. And they say --- if there is a problem in committee they say, hey, I didn't say that and people say, well, no, you didn't, so we'll change it. So that's why we approve minutes. And once they're approved, they go everywhere. But unapproved minutes should not be taken and sent out. If there was a meeting coming up for Budget and Finance which I am Chair, then that's fine. We send the meeting out to every Council person so they can review it and see if there is mistakes so when we have the committee meeting we can correct those mistakes. Those mistakes are not corrected without the committee knowing it.

It's not the person, the clerk, or anyone else, that if I go to them and say, hey, John DeFazio didn't say that. He said this. The clerk or whoever is in charge of those minutes is not going to change that without the approval of the committee. It happens in committee.

So what I am saying is that that does refer to things in the committee. The minutes are in the committee. They're there. And according to our Rules of Council, that a --- one individual cannot be pulling stuff out of committee and sending it all over the world because that's what --- they've come up with an idea. I'm not saying anything about your idea. That's fine. You can come up with ideas, but don't take stuff out of committee and send it all over the place because that is not correct according to the Rules of Council. And Robert's Rules, it's not going to help you here, because the Rules of Council tells you exactly what you have to do if you want to take something out of committee.

I made a motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We're still under comment. One thing, Sue, he's right about. The Rules of Council supersedes Robert's Rules of Order. If you don't have a Rule of Council then we go by Robert's Rules. But the Rules of Council supersedes the issue when it comes to Robert's Rules or our Council Rules. We go by Council. Who was next?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I have a couple of points.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: First of all, I'm chairman of Public Safety. Unapproved minutes given to the public when you're dealing with public safety can be, in theory, a nightmare. That being said, there were a couple of issues that were brought up here, one in terms of the staff providing the information, you know, to the Council person. Staff issues need to be dealt with --- the three directors, and if it rises to any higher than that, then that's what --- Mr. Futules' committee deals with those types of things.

Now, the Council person had evoked the --- our solicitor's name in term. So the question that I have for our solicitor --- and I say this because I don't want the appearance in terms of my vote being against anyone as an individual, but just being in terms of protecting what is correct, protecting the Rules of Council, making sure that any information that is given to the public is correct and doesn't --- like I said, in terms of public safety, can certain ---. Just like for instance, we had a committee meeting in Public Safety dealing with the Ebola situation. Now, imagine those kind of minutes dealing with that when it would say --- in a crisis, and the minutes being wrong

and the minutes getting out to the public. Can you imagine the kind of nightmare that could create? That's my concern objectively. It has nothing to do with any personalities here. So I'm going to ask our solicitor, were the Rules of Council broken here before I can vote?

MR. CAMBEST: Well, let me say first that the two e-mails that were referenced, I'm not going to comment on those because they were --- they were part of a personnel issue that could be part of the censure. And I don't know what Ms. Means is going to say, that she didn't direct somebody or the person did it on their own, so I'm not going to get into that portion of it. But the e-mail, as I stated specifically --- because there was a question to what I was going to be doing in regard to this legislation. And I told Ms. Means, and I told staff that I will review these as to form only. In fact, the first legislation that was sent over to me was improper because it contained two subjects. And I made Ms. Means aware of that and the staff member who worked on that, and it was changed.

As legal counsel, I'm not going to tell you what to put in a piece of legislation. The substance of the legislation is up to you. I will tell you if it's in proper form. And that's all that e-mail is meant to do. It had nothing to do with condoning what Ms. Means was putting in the substance of the ordinance. That's not my job. It's up to you to either vote or vote it down.

In regard to the Rules of Council, Mr. DeFazio is correct. Robert's Rules of Order never come into play unless there is an absence of a rule on --- in our Rules of Council. Mr. Finnerty pointed out the issue, that he felt a violation of the Rule occurred. And I will say that if anybody in this Council takes minutes that are not approved and gives them to the public, that's a violation of our Rule. No question about it.

Now, Ms. Means wants to say that's a mistake, that's up to you to make a decision. It's a violation of the Rule.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you, Mr. Cambest. I just want to say publicly that my vote on this is solely on preventing misinformation that could cause serious problems to the public being prevented in the future. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Mr. President, thank you for recognizing me here. I guess the previous speakers, there's been some statements as to what our particular Rules of Council are. And I think there's some disagreement among some of the members of Council as to the clarity of that. And in the e-mails that were referred to, to our solicitor --- and I understand you're saying that you review these for form. Okay. Would not a violation of our Rules --- would that not be something that you would tell us if we sent you something that was in clear violation of the Rules?

MR. CAMBEST: It's not a violation in --- I'm not going to get involved in it. If you want me to get involved in it, I will do that. But that was not what I was requested to do. And this was done under a personnel decision, and that's why I don't want to get into it. So it was limited to that only. If I want to start taking over Mr. Barker and Mr. Catanese and Mr. Szymanski's staff, I'm going to ask you to change my contract and I'll ask for more money. But that's not what I was asked to do. I was asked to look at the legislation and say whether or not it was in proper form. That's all.

MR. DEMARCO: Understood. Could it have been assumed by a member of Council that by sending something to you and then it getting back, not understanding that you were reviewing only for form, that they may have believed that in proceeding with that legislation that that was a reasonable piece of legislation?

MR. CAMBEST: I don't think in this case because we had a previous discussion already on the map. The previous legislation dealt with --- there was an exemption that asked for residential and commercial --- I think it's Act 42 and Act 207. Don't ask me if they're the correct Acts, but because we were putting both of those into one ordinance my suggestion was, as to form, we change them. I'm not telling you whether it's a good or bad or a violation of this or a violation to that. As to form, you need two separate ordinances. That's all. That's all I did. And Ms. Means knew that because we discussed that issue previously. And so did the staff member who was involved.

MR. DEMARCO: Well, Mr. President, the last thing I would point out is that in paragraph seven and paragraph eight of the Whereases, the word presumably is used here. So I have a question with that. I mean,

somebody either did something directly or they did not. If they did, we have evidence or there's been a confession or something to that effect. And I guess because a censure is viewed as a punitive act, or at least I view it that way, shouldn't we be sure or be certain that someone, in fact, did do this, if we're going to take a vote on that?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: To answer that, Mike was involved. Mike? And then we'll get back to you.

MR. FINNERTY: Well, if you listen to what Councilwoman Means said, she said at least three times that she directed this. So she took that presume --- we can get rid of that because I didn't know for sure.

MR. CAMBEST: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. CAMBEST: If we're going to go any further into who did what, who said what, I think we ought to go into Executive Session because we're getting into an area of a personnel issue and a confidential issue.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, ---.

MR. WALTON: On the motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. One more speaker, then we'll do it. I told him before to wait a minute. Go ahead.

MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of Council. I don't think we're talking about the legislation. Legislation is not in question. It's the violation of the Rule of Council. Now, we can interpret things, we can assume --- and we all know what assume means --- various things. But whether this action to send the minutes out was either a mistake or intended, it happened. It was a violation. The legislation is not the same as circulating information that's confidential to outside parties that is confidential to the members of Council.

So I think we have to remember that the procedures and protocol also was not followed. And therefore, there's a violation of Rules of Council. And thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Let's go to recess for a minute for Executive Session.

MR. FINNERTY: Excuse me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. FINNERTY: Why don't we just vote on it?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, the only way we can do that is ---.

MR. FINNERTY: We have a motion and I think ---.

MR. MACEY: Second.

MR. FINNERTY: A second.

MR. WALTON: It's been properly moved and seconded.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. WALTON: We need to move on the motion.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That's correct. I mean, so why don't we take --- no more comments? What?

MR. KRESS: The only comment I have is I'm probably going to abstain because I'd like to see this --- I want more information. She says she's got e-mails. You know, I'd like to see an Executive Committee just to review. But that's just my thing. We're going to be voting on a censure motion. I'd just like to get more information. That's my opinion. So I'd abstain at this point.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Let's take a roll call vote on this.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: No.

MS. MEANS: Point of order. Are we voting to call the question? Are we voting on ---?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We're voting on Mr. Finnerty's motion here.

MS. MEANS: Okay. Thank you.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Finnerty?

MR. FINNERTY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: No.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Klein?

MR. KLEIN: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Abstain.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. CATANESE: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: No.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Abstain.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Mr. DeFazio, President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. CATANESE: Nine yeses, four nos with two
abstentions. It passes.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Notification of Contracts,
do we have any, Joe? No?
MR. CANTANESE: No. I'll read it. I'll just
read it.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.
MR. CATANESE: 9352-16. Communication
summarizing approved Executive Actions from December 1st,
2015 through December 31st, 2015.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: If we could just --- someone
want to make a motion to receive and file?
MR. FINNERTY: Receive and file.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to second it?
MR. MACEY: Second.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor. Any
remarks? All those in favor signify by saying aye.
(Ayes respond.)
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
We already did the summarizing of the Executive Action.
Public Comment on General Items, we have one. Jim Barr.
Okay.
MR. BARR: Good evening. I'm here to relate my
experience and observation of Bellevue Road and Jacks Run
Road Extension which I believe are County roads in Ross
Township.
First of all, I wanted to report a rippled
highway at the intersections of Bellevue Road and State
Route 19. That's the West View Borough and Ross Township
area. Another rippled road at the intersection of
Bellevue Road and Hinkle Road intersection. These are
roads that are pretty well in repair. The other road is
on Bellevue Road and Jacks Run Road Extension. That also

needs to be checked out for degree of safety of the road, I guess.

Also, I'd like to report that the Jacks Run Road and Bellevue Road Bridge overpass of I-279, it does have wide and safe walkway and are protected by Jersey barriers. However, the ingress and the egress of the Jacks Run Road Extension overpass is --- it's overgrown. The weeds are overgrown, and the bushes need trimmed down and cut back. And plus, there is much trash on the walkway.

Jacks Run Road Extension coming up the Bellevue Road at --- is in much need of a pedestrian walkway along the road. It seems that Pittsburgh has provided safe bike travel along their highways. I think it's important that we also have --- pedestrians need safe travel also.

Furthermore, I've been driving Bellevue Road for --- since 1969 and for the first time ever, the last snowfall I was unable to make traction to get up the road, and I had to turn around and go back which was a big problem with the, you know, the snow-covered road. My concern is that I wanted to know are these indications of the type of road service that we, the people of Allegheny County, can expect in the future?

And last of all, I wanted to make a point about --- the organizational meeting at the beginning of this month was on the Tuesday. I suggest that the Council website page have a specific note about that change of that meeting date. That's all I have. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. DEMARCO: So moved.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Ayes respond.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:03 P.M.

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Valerie Gregory
Court Reporter

Valerie Gregory