# ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

### REGULAR MEETING

# - - -**BEFORE:**

John P. DeFazio	_	President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules	_	Vice President, District 7

Nicholas Futules - Vice President, D
Samuel DeMarco, III - Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker - District 1
Cindy Kirk - District 2
Edward Kress - District 3
Patrick Catena - District 4
Sue Means - District 5
John F. Palmiere - District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni - District 8
Robert J. Macey - District 9
DeWitt Walton - District 10
Paul Klein - District 11
James Ellenbogen - District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell - District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse Fourth Floor, Gold Room 436 Grant Street Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219 Tuesday, January 17, 2017 - 5:03 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC. 429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300 Pittsburgh, PA 15219 (412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

#### IN ATTENDANCE:

William McKain - Allegheny County Manager

Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services

Walter Szymanski - Budget Director

Jack Cambest - County Council Solicitor

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll come to order. Will you now rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for a moment of silent prayer or reflection? After me with the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Pledge of Allegiance.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll have the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Here.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
MS. KIRK: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?

(No Response.)

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Here.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Here.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeFazio, President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.

MR. BARKER: Thirteen (13) members present.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: At this time we would like to place Pat Catena to take the vacant seat of Mike

Finnerty. Would you come forward, Pat, and Judge Spurgeon here?

MS. MEANS: Oh, we didn't ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Oh, I'm sorry. Yeah, I'm

sorry. You're right. We didn't vote.

MR. MACEY: I make a motion to appoint Pat

Catena.

```
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none,
all those in favor signify by saying aye.
          (Chorus of ayes.)
         PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.
We didn't have to do that, but I did it anyway. Okay.
         MR. CATENA: Where do you want us?
         PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, right up front.
         JUDGE SPURGEON: So good evening, everyone.
Thanks for asking me to come over this evening. I'm Judge
David Spurgeon. I'm currently assigned to the Family
Division of the Courthouse. And it's wonderful to be in a
place where we're going to be celebrating something I see
a lot of people on a normal basis that aren't at their
best moments. But this is a positive thing. I see the
Steel Valley Football team and a variety of other people
so I'm happy to be here.
         So if I could have you, sir, raise your right
hand. And repeat after me. I ---
         MR. CATENA: I ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- Patrick Catena, ---
         MR. CATENA: --- Patrick Catena, ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- do solemnly swear ---
         MR. CATENA: --- do solemnly swear ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- that I will faithfully
execute ---
         MR. CATENA: --- that I will faithfully
execute ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- the office of Member of
Council ---
         MR. CATENA: --- the office of Member of
Council ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- of the County of
Allegheny ---
         MR. CATENA: --- of the County of Allegheny ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- and will, to the best of my
         MR. CATENA: --- and will, to the best of my
ability ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- preserve ---
         MR. CATENA: --- preserve ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- protect ---
         MR. CATENA: --- protect ---
         JUDGE SPURGEON: --- defend ---
         MR. CATENA: --- and defend ---
```

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Second.

JUDGE SPURGEON: --- and obey ---

MR. CATENA: --- and obey ---

JUDGE SPURGEON: --- the Constitution of the

United States ---

MR. CATENA: --- the Constitution of the United States ---

JUDGE SPURGEON: --- and the laws of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

MR. CATENA: --- and the laws of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania.

JUDGE SPURGEON: And so may it be this 17th day of January as I, a commissioned Judge in the State of Pennsylvania, am the first to congratulate you. Congratulations, sir.

MR. CATENA: Thank you very much.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Would you like to say a few words?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Go ahead.

MR. CATENA: Thank you very much, sir. Thank you, Judge Spurgeon, and thank you to my new colleagues on County Council for showing your confidence in me tonight with your vote. This is, indeed, a proud moment. a group of public servants with such dedication to our neighbors across the entire county. I am so humbled to be standing here right now and I can't in good conscious go further without thanking a few people. As a resident of the 4th District and a local official within it, I'm grateful that our community had such a staunch advocate as Mike Finnerty representing us on Council for so many years, and I realize I have big shoes to fill. But I am thrilled to know he'll be continuing to fight for us in his new role alongside State Representative Kulik, and I thank him for his support as well as his dedicated service to our district.

Executive Fitzgerald, I am honored to have his support and I look forward in helping continue all the tremendous work you've done in advancing Allegheny County.

Treasurer John Weinstein's heartfelt devotion to our community and the taxpayers for the better part of two decades is truly a genuine inspiration to me. I'm proud not only to have his support, but to also call him my friend.

Congressman Mike Doyle, State Senator Wayne Fontana, State Reps Anita Kulik, Dan Deasy and Dan Miller and so many other elected officials, chairs and individual committee members throughout our entire District 4, I thank you.

Also, I'd like to thank someone special that's been helping me for the past eight years and guiding me and actually got me started in County --- in local government and that would be Michael Sarsfield.

Also I would be remiss if I didn't thank both my mother, Ann Catena, and Susan Banaszak Catena, my son Jack's mother, for being so supportive of my career in public service.

And last, but by far the most, I want to thank my little man, my son. There will never be a role I am more proud of than being Jack's father. Jack is a big part of why I'm so excited to take on this new challenge. When I began my career in public service one of my foremost goals was to ensure he would grow up in the best Carnegie possible. I'm grateful for the opportunity to represent District 4 because to me, it's important to do everything within my abilities to make sure that our next generation inherits both a district and a county they, too, can be proud to call home.

Thank you for my friends in Carnegie that have supported me for so long. Carnegie over the years has blossomed and it will continue to blossom because of the team work and everyone working together to move the town forwards.

I pledge to serve you both Carnegie and every other community in the 4th District to the best of my abilities. And am eager to work with my new colleagues to continue our collective goal to keep bettering Allegheny County. Being a local elected official for as many years as I have served have afforded me the unique opportunity and ability to bring positive ideas to the taxpayers of Allegheny County. Working with this truly esteemed Council will not only be a tremendous highlight in my life, but it will enable me to diligently learn about the operation of this great government while always protecting the taxpayers and serving as an advocate for them.

With that, I can now proudly join this esteemed body and we can proceed with conducting the business of the County doing what's always right for the taxpayers of this great County. Thank you and may God bless.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Does your wife or anybody want to come up?

MR. CATENA: Do you want to come up?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Come up front and take a picture.

MR. JACK CATENA: Hello. And God be with you all.

MR. FUTULES: Here, put this on your dad. Does he want to give a speech?

MR. JACK CATENA: I want to give a speech. PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You guys want to come up front and take a picture?

MR. JACK CATENA: Thank you, dad. (Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Jack, go up there and take Mike's seat, old seat. 9974-17.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation declaring Tuesday, January 17th, 2017 as Purple Heart Day and designating Allegheny County as Purple Heart County in partnership with the Military Order of the Purple Heart, Greater Pittsburgh, Chapter 455. Sponsored by Council Members DeMarco, Baker, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Kirk, Klein, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Ranalli-Russell, Walton and the Chief Executive.

MR. DEMARCO: I'd like to thank everyone who's come here today. Anyone that's attended Allegheny County Council meetings know that we use these proclamations as a way of honoring many of our citizens who have gone above and beyond or done things that are notable within the communities.

I'm privileged today --- and Greg, do you want to step up here? I'm privileged today to honor folks who have won the Purple Heart. Many of you may not have seen it, but late this afternoon there was a joint proclamation that was issued by the County Executive. And it says here, by Joint Proclamation, County Executive, Rich Fitzgerald and Council Member Samuel DeMarco today proclaimed Tuesday, January 17th, 2017 as Purple Heart Day in Allegheny County and designated the County as a Purple Heart County. The Proclamation will be formally presented at County Council's 5:00 p.m. meeting this evening.

Our region is one of the densest veterans' communities in the nation with 9 to 12 percent of our population having served their country. We are grateful

for the service of each of these men and women, said Fitzgerald.

I'm honored to join Council Member DeMarco in particularly recognizing those who received a Purple Heart as a result of that service. The Purple Heart is the oldest military decoration in use today. It evolved from the badge of military merit created in 1782 by General George Washington for the common soldier. The Purple Heart is specifically awarded to any member of the United States Armed Services wounded or killed in combat by a declared enemy of the United States.

As a fellow veteran, it is my privilege to honor the men and women of Allegheny County who have given so much in service to our country. We owe them all a debt of gratitude. Today's designation was made in partnership with the Military Order of the Purple Heart, Greater Pittsburgh Chapter 455. This effort pays tribute to the sacrifices of all the men and women of the Armed Forces who have been wounded or pay the ultimate price with their lives while protecting our country and the freedoms we enjoy.

The Proclamation reads ---.

WHEREAS, the Purple Heart is the oldest military decoration used today and it evolved from the Badge of Military Merit created in 1782 by General George Washington for the common solider, and;

WHEREAS, the Purple Heart is specifically awarded to any member of the United States Armed Services wounded or killed in combat by a declared enemy of the United States, and;

WHEREAS, the Allegheny County has great admiration and the upmost gratitude for all of the men and women of the Armed Forces who have selflessly served their country and this county and who have borne the brunt of battle, and;

WHEREAS, veterans have paid the high price for freedom by leaving their families and communities and placing themselves in harm's way for the good of all, and;

WHEREAS, the contributions and sacrifices of the men and women of Allegheny County who served in the Armed Forces have been vital in maintaining the freedoms and way of life enjoyed by our citizens, and;

WHEREAS, Purple Heart recipients are an integral part of our society, and it is important that we

acknowledge them for their courage and show them the support that they have earned, and;

WHEREAS, in partnership with the Military Order of the Purple Heart, Greater Pittsburgh, Chapter 455, Allegheny County Council and Allegheny County Executive Rich Fitzgerald does move to join counties across the country in becoming a Purple Heart County.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that we, the Council of Allegheny County and Allegheny County Executive Rich Fitzgerald, do hereby proclaim Tuesday, January 17th, 2017 as Purple Heart Day and designates Allegheny County, Pennsylvania as a Purple Heart County. Sponsored by Council Member Samuel DeMarco and all members of Council and County Executive, Rich Fitzgerald and presented this day, the 17th day of January, 2017.

I have here the President of the Greater Pittsburgh Military Order of the Purple Heart, Greg Daley. I would like to award this Proclamation to you as well as provide you with Proclamations to give to the other members of the Military Order of the Purple Heart who have earned the Purple Heart in combat.

Would you like to say a few words?

MR. DALY: Yes. We would like to thank all of County Council and the Executive Director Rich Fitzgerald for this opportunity. We have a lot of comrades that are no longer with us, but we're accepting this and thank you so very, very much for recognizing the ones that are still with you. Thank you so much.

MR. DEMARCO: Would you like --- all of the folks who are here we can get a picture up here, the folks that are represented and if they can ---?

(Pictures taken.)

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. 9975-17.

MR. BARKER: Before continuing, let the record reflect that Mr. Klein is present.

9975-17. Proclamation recognizing Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans for providing certified service dogs to local veterans suffering from PTSD, Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder, and/or TBI, Traumatic Brain Injury. Sponsored by Council Members DeMarco, Baker, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Finnerty, Futules, Kirk, Klein, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Means, Palmiere, Ranalli-Russell and Walton.

MR. DEMARCO: Folks, our military has been serving in combat here in this nation for a period since

2001 of over 15 years, which is one of the longest, sustained amounts of time where folks have been in combat. And one of the true tragedies of this is that many of our military folk are coming back suffering from PTSD or TBI which is Traumatic Brain Injury. Many folks are aware or have read where service members are committing suicide at the rate of up to 22 members a day. This is a true, true tragedy.

But one of the bright lights here that's arisen that shows some promise in helping these folks is through the use of service animals and particularly service dogs. A charity that was brought to my attention by a good friend, Carmella Mullen, a while back ago introduced me to some wonderful folks --- Tony Accamando, Don Accamando and an entire group here, Life Changing Service Dogs for Veterans. And they started this group from scratch with the intent to try to raise money to purchase service dogs for veterans from Western Pennsylvania suffering from PTSD or TBI. Now, these service dogs --- when we talk about service dogs, they're trained far more extensively than come, fetch, roll over. And the cost to train these dogs is \$22,000 a dog. Tony has taken this upon himself as a challenge and has set the goal of raising \$500,000 to provide 22 dogs in 22 months to 22 veterans here in Western Pennsylvania. Tony, could you come up here while I read this proclamation?

WHEREAS, Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans --- excuse me, and Carol, do you want to come up and bring Elvira? We have a special guest here. Elvira is a trained service dog.

WHEREAS, Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans was established by Pittsburgh native, Vietnam veteran and owner of Veterans Cable Services, Tony Accamando in order to fund the extensive training regimen required of service dogs and to pair, free of charge, those dogs with local veterans suffering from physical disabilities or cognitive challenges resulting from traumatic brain injuries, TBI, or post traumatic stress disorder or PTSD, and;

WHEREAS, service dogs can perform tasks, improve mobility and provide unconditional love and companionship helping veteran return to lives of greater independence and fulfillment, and;

WHEREAS, service dogs can mean the difference between life and death for a veteran suffering with PTSD, and;

WHEREAS, Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans hopes to acquire 22 service dogs over a period of 22 months through a partnership with Guardian Angels Medical Service Dogs at a cost of approximately \$500,000. The number 22 is significant because according to the Veterans Administration an average of 22 veterans commit suicide every day, and;

WHEREAS, through the generosity of donors, supporters and its annual Much Strut fundraiser, Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans has made a significant impact on this bold endeavor.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby recognize and honor the devoted work of Life-Changing Service Dogs for Veterans and its supporters for helping the men and women who so bravely served our country lead more independent lives by providing them with service dogs. Sponsored by Council Member Sam DeMarco and all members of Allegheny County Council and --- presented this 17th day of January 2017.

Tony, would you like to say a few words? And then Carol, I invite you up as well.

MR. ACCAMANDO: Thanks very much, Sam and to the entire Council and elected officials. This wonderful County of Allegheny, a county in which I lived and was born. I'd also like to recognize Don Accamando and Tom Begandy, Carmella and Jim Mullen, I'm going to ask them to come up and Chris Bordon, who is the husband of Carol. And Carol really is going to be the driving force behind this, as well as someone representing the Treasury's office.

In brief, Sam says it all. In an attempt to come to the defense, if you will, of veterans who are struggling with cognitive or physical disability, these dogs are remarkable. And Carol can say a little bit more. She and Chris have come up from Florida. That's where the dogs are trained. This beautiful dog, Elvira, is just one example of what is possible with the help of so many people that have donated money for this great cause.

So Carol, would you please come up and finish this little presentation?

MS. BORDON: Well, I'm sure there's no fear of redundancy here in thanking you once again because it's an honor to be here, and I thank you greatly for recognizing the mission, the work that Tony's been doing for veterans. You know, I serve our country this way. I wasn't actually

in the military, but I do serve and I ask every individual to also serve their country by helping our veterans because they are what make it possible for us to be here attending these meetings and enjoying our everyday lives. And what a great day to be here on the Proclamation of Purple Heart Day because we are deeply invested in the long-term care of our veterans. They seriously need the long-term care when they have given everything for our country.

These dogs are amazing. We custom train each one of them to help the individual veteran with the needs that they may have, which gives them an opportunity to have a new chapter in their life and can replace a caregiver and actually give them their dignity and freedom back. This dog right here, they're all trained to be as invisible as possible when they're not actually doing a task. But this dog right here can open and close doors, turn on and off lights, bring you food and water from the refrigerator. If you are unconscious, could go hit a 9-1-1 button without being told. And the list goes on and on. So we custom train them to help every individual veteran with their particular disabilities.

Yes, we talk about the 22 deaths that we encounter every day from our veterans. And many of those veterans come to us with multiple suicide attempts and in very dark places, very broken. But I am very proud to say that of the nearly 200 teams that we have placed across the country, many of them are right here in your county and in Pennsylvania, we have never had a suicide. Thank you.

MR. DEMARCO: I would like to add that the County Executive, Rich Fitzgerald, wanted to be here today, but he's in Harrisburg for meetings today and tomorrow. So he wanted to express his regrets that he wasn't able to make it because of that. But I would also like to recognize the Treasurer's Office here who --- the treasury, they've gone above and beyond in order to help to disseminate information here to the citizens of Allegheny County who have dog licenses. So do you want to say a few words on behalf of Treasurer Weinstein?

MR. BOYLE: Sure. Treasurer Weinstein also regrets that he could not be here tonight. He did appreciate the opportunity to participate in this program. And he believes that the participation of our office as

well as the dog owners of Allegheny County will make a difference in the lives of our veterans. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. DEMARCO: Thank you. I would also like to recognize Pam Iovino and Michael Pallarina (phonetic). Pam is the new chair or chief executive of our Veterans Affairs Office and Michael is her deputy, if you could just raise your hands?

(Applause.)

MR. DEMARCO: I look forward to meeting with you and talking with you further on how we can help the veterans of Allegheny County. Thank you all so much.

(Applause.)

MR. DEMARCO: Oh, pictures.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Come on up for the pictures. (Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9976-17.

MR. BARKER: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2016 Steel Valley High School Football Team for winning the 2016 PIAA and WPIAL Class 2A Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

MR. KLEIN: I'm Councilman Paul Klein, and I'm joined by my esteemed colleague who has very deep roots in the Steel Valley, Bob Macey. And I should say by way of beginning tonight that you have really set the bar very high for the Steelers. And so they really have a lot to live up to this weekend.

So by way of recognizing the Steel Valley Football Team, the late Chief Justice Earl Warren once said that when he picked up the paper every morning, he would turn first to the sports pages because the sports pages record people's accomplishments. The front pages report their failures, as he saw it.

This evening we gather here to honor the accomplishments of a great organization, a team made up of many, both on and off the field, who with great pride and passion have done not just the Steel Valley proud, but this County and this region. Steel Valley's 49-7 win over a highly touted Southern Columbia not only gave Steel Valley its first state championship, but this amazing team completed what Post Gazette sportswriter Mike White called one of the most dominant wins ever by a Pennsylvania team.

With a mercy rule in place, this team had their opponents, well, we might say begging for mercy, 15 times this season and secured Steel Valley a place on the list

of all-time great Pennsylvania sports teams. That's really a great thing.

(Applause.)

MR. KLEIN: As we all know, football, as an organized sport has taken more than a few hits over the past few years, no pun intended. And despite the concerns that many quite legitimately have about this sport, there is much good that will hopefully sustain these athletes long after their trophies have yellowed with age and their uniforms have been retired.

Football careers are short, but life, it if goes according to plan, can be long. Lessons learned from sport can live on, can endure to help all who we honor tonight to create a better life. To take what you've learned about teamwork, discipline, focus and inclusiveness, as well as grace and humility and carry those virtues with you to other important endeavors in your life. The family you build, the career you aspire to, your education and your engagement in the life of your community. All these pursuits can and should be the beneficiaries of all that you learned on that playing field at Steel Valley.

Congratulations to the players, coaches, teachers, administrators and families on this great moment. Congratulations to Steel Valley.

(Applause.)

MR. KLEIN: So I'd like to call Athletic Director Shawn McAllister? Is he here? No. And how about Coach Rodney Steele? Okay. Coach Steele. And do the players want to come on up for a big picture?

(Applause.)

MR. KLEIN: Bob, do you want to say something?
MR. MACEY: Although Steel Valley is not in my
district, if I leave my plan of homes and I make a
right-hand turn I'm right in Munhall. Okay? Which is
part of Steel Valley School District. I had the pleasure
of working in the school district for about ten months and
I got to know and meet a lot of these young people who are
fine gentlemen and, of course, there's a lot of fine
ladies in that school district as well. And I've always,
you know, wanted to be here and work with Paul Klein and
recognize these young men that have really attained a
unique goal. They're number one in the country. Think
about that. Number one in the country.

(Applause.)

MR. KLEIN: So we have a Proclamation here and let me share that with you this evening. We've got a number of players here, Coach Steele. There are many people to be recognized. How many assistant coaches do you have? I thought it was 18, but they've got quite a roster, but ---.

This Certificate of Achievement is awarded to the 2016-2017 Steel Valley High School Football Team in recognition of winning the 2016 PIAA and WHPIAL Class AA football championships. The Steel Valley Ironmen Football team has made history by winning the school's first state title. We commend and recognize each player and coach whose determination and resolve led to this achievement. The team has set a positive example of excellence for all of Allegheny County, continuing evidence that this is the County of Champions. This achievement has conferred honor on this County and is an accomplishment in which the entire community can be proud. So congratulations all of you.

(Applause.)

MR. KLEIN: Wait a minute. This is for you, Coach Steele, and would you like to say a few words? COACH STEELE: Sure. On behalf of Steel Valley School District I want to thank Councilman Klein and Councilman Macey and also the colleagues up there for inviting us out for this Proclamation. It surely was a successful season and one that I'll cherish for the rest of my lifetime. Being involved with a bunch of great coaches and players, you know, this would never happen. But you know, with their effort and energy that went into this program, you know, we made it happen. And it starts with, you know, our coaches being able to take the time away from their families to teach these young men not just the game of football, but character and life skills. There's something that goes on within our organization that I don't know if other organizations can say they do. We have an academic study hall every day after school that we make sure our kids do their homework before they go to practice. And I'm proud to announce ---.

(Applause.)

MR. STEELE: And I'm proud to announce going into the playoff tournament that our team GPA was a 3.08. (Applause.)

MR. STEELE: A lot of our kids couldn't be here today because they're participating in other sports, but

you know, like Councilman Macey said, the honors keep coming in. And I'll tell you, you know, it happens to good people and to surround yourself with good clientele, coaches and players that buy into your organization, into your system, you know, that's why MaxPreps named Steel Valley the number one small school football team in the USA.

(Applause.)

MR. STEELE: Now, without furthermore, on behalf of Steel Valley School District I want to thank everybody for having us out tonight, and thank you and God bless.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9977-17.

MR. BARKER: Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2016 USO, University Prep/Sci-Tech/Obama Academy, Football Team for winning the 2016 City League Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Member Walton.

MR. WALTON: Thank you. I'd like to first ask if Athletic Director Starr Macklin and Head Coach Lou Berry and if any of the football team present, come forward? Come on in, guys.

(Applause.)

MR. WALTON: It is with a distinct amount of pleasure that we're here tonight to give these Certificates of Recognition to USO, Sci-Tech/Obama Academy, for winning the 2016 City League Championship. (Applause.)

MR. WALTON: Far too often in our community, we hear a host of comments about negativity. We hear the things about what young men and young women don't do or can't do. I think first and foremost, this group is to be recognized for coming together in a collaborative effort from different parts of the community to do what they needed to do in the Hill District every day. Their work, their determination, their diligence and their commitment to success is just an example of what does go on on a daily basis in those communities and what is going to go forward as they move on in their lives.

So we want to dispel the negative and accentuate the positive. There's work to be done. These young men are an example of what can and what does happen. And these coaches are examples of what leadership and mentorship is all about. So all of them are to be commended. So I thank you. And with that, we're going to

get into this Proclamation and let these young men celebrate their day, continue to celebrate their day.

This Certificate of Achievement is awarded to the 2016-2017 USO, University Prep/Sci-Tech/Obama Academy Football Team in recognition of winning the 2016 City League Football Championship. We commend and recognize each player and coach whose determination and resolve lead to this achievement. This team as set a positive example of excellence for all of Allegheny County, continuing evidence that this is a County of Champions. This achievement has conferred honor on this County and is an accomplishment in which the entire community can be proud.

So Mr. Macklin, Mr. Berry, would you like to make comments?

COACH BERRY: Just real brief. Good evening. First and foremost, I'd like to thank each and every Council member for this invitation down to the courthouse to expose our fine, young men to such a positive experience. Me, as a head coach, I just first want to say how blessed I am to work with these young men; very mannerable, very respectful. Couldn't tell you how many compliments we got throughout the course of the season from the opposing teams, coaching staffs, opposing teams, parents, about how well behaved and mannerable our student athletes were. And as a coach, I'm really blessed because these kids give me their heart and soul on each and every day that we're at practice and when we're competing on the field.

But I also wanted to take advantage of this opportunity to say how blessed I am as a coach. Yes, head coaches get all the credit, all the glory. Sometimes it's not fair, but the coaching staff that I have has been amazing, the fact that they give up their time. Spending time, quality time, away from their families, the fact that they embrace these young men as their sons as well. And I never take it for granted. I look forward going to practice every day mainly because of my coaching staff, because they're a very humble. They're very humble individuals, very selfless individuals, and you don't find that quite often when you're in this field of work. So I just wanted to praise my assistant coaches today and really let them know how much I appreciate their efforts.

(Applause.)

MR. WALTON: And with that, let's pass these out. You guys led them all year, do that, too.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President, point of order. PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I wanted to say I'm probably more proud of these young men than anyone in this room because a long time ago when this school was called Peabody High School, I'm an alumni of that school. And if you look back far enough you'll see that we beat Westinghouse in 1971 for the championship at Three Rivers Stadium.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9978-17.

MR. BARKER: Proclamation thanking the Coro Pittsburgh Martin Luther King, Jr. Leadership Award finalists for their work to improve civic life in the Pittsburgh region. Sponsored by Council Members Means, Baker, DeMarco, Kirk and Kress.

MR. BAKER: Thank you, Mr. President. We'd love other co-sponsors. I think we're just getting the word out so ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'd like to co-sponsor.

MR. BAKER: Thank you. Thank you.

MR. WALTON: Myself as well, Jared.

MR. MACEY: Put us all on.

MR. BARKER: Anyone not like to be added?

MR. BAKER: Your first one, Pat. Pat is in. This is your dad's first proclamation. This is very special. Very good. So we're very proud to have some amazing friends from the Coro Center for Civic Leadership here tonight. We want to invite Jen Hollowman and all of the Coro finalist to please join us here at the front now.

We saw some amazing, amazing teams being recognized tonight. And the Coro team is pretty incredible. I will say Team Emmai is out of control tonight so you guys --- Emmai Alaquiva.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Team Emmai. Yeah. He's the one that taught me how to wear a bow tie, too, so --- which is true. Yeah. So if some of the finalists --- yeah. So we have come great --- we have some great finalists here for the awards. A lot of you are probably out yesterday. We had some amazing community celebrations. The Evana Kelly Strahorn was incredible. There were 800 plus people there for that MLK Day celebration. It was really inspiring. Councilwoman Ranalli-Russell and I were down at the event

at the August Wilson Center which was also terrific, 100 plus people at that. It was a great day to bring people together.

The Coro Center for Civic Leadership will be doing the same thing next Saturday at the Annual MLK Leadership Boards. It's always an incredible event, and there's some fantastic finalists. Now, the one thing --- a lot of award events you kind of know who's winning going into it. Coro and Jen and everyone, they keep us guessing. So we do not know who's winning yet for the different awards this year. But it really is an incredible group of finalists that will be recognized at the Coro MLK awards. If you've never been to the event, I definitely would encourage you to attend. It's a great community gathering, a really, truly inspiring community gathering.

I'm lucky that some of my Council colleagues have been involved in Coro over the years as well. Erin and I have been involved with Coro since 2003, 2004. We're alums of the program. Erin used to work there. We have a lot of love for the Coro Center for Civic Leadership. I know Councilwoman Kirk and Councilwoman Means both got to serve on a panel for Coro which is a lot of fun. And the Coro fellows, we work with Jen Hollowman make sure that they come down to a County Council meeting every year to learn about local government, and then we do a little Q and A with them afterwards. So there's a good standing relationship between County Council and the Coro Center for Civic Leadership. And with that, let's get into finding out who these finalists are. Councilwoman Means is going to announce them for you guys. Get you all fired up.

MS. MEANS: I don't know. It's a hard act to follow, Tom Baker. He gets like all super psyched here.

So it's my honor to be one of the sponsors. And I just absolutely think Coro is just a great organization encouraging young professionals to get involved with our community and make our community better. I went on the website today and saw that Coro's vision is to make an inclusive community where people of all backgrounds and circumstances participate in making their communities a --- more livable for everyone. Here they are. Emmai Alaquiva. I messed it up. Emmai Alaquiva, Leah Lizarondo, John Wallace, Jr., Barbara Arroyo, Erin Baker, James Earl Doyle, Hashamma Jamil, Nicole Harrington,

Delante Icarus Murphy. And then we have three organizations; 412 Food Rescue, Homewood Children's Village and the Pennsylvania Innocence Project.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: Congratulations.

MR. BAKER: And with that, Councilwoman Means is going to read the Proclamation. Then we'll hear from some of the ---.

MS. MEANS: All right.

WHEREAS, the Mission of Coro Pittsburgh is to advance ethical and effective leaders who share a commitment to civic engagements, and;

WHEREAS, since 2009, Coro Pittsburgh has presented the Martin Luther King, Jr. Leadership Award to recognize the individuals and organizations in our region that exemplify values-based leadership, and;

WHEREAS, on January 28th, 2017 at the Double Tree Hotel downtown, Coro Pittsburgh will recognize the following finalists for the MLK, Jr. Leadership Awards. Distinguished Individual Leadership, Emmai --- I'm going to mess it up again, Alaquiva, Leah Lizarondo and John Wallace, Jr. Let's give them a hand.

(Applause.)

MS.MEANS: Distinguished Coro Alumni Leadership, Barbara Arroyo, Erin Baker and James Earl Doyle.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: Distinguished Organizational Leadership, 412 Food Rescue, Homewood Children's Village and Pennsylvania Innocence Project.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: The Distinguished Emerging Leadership is Hashaam Jamil, Nicole Harrington and Delante Murphy.

Now, there --- oh, clap.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: Got to be fair. Got to be fair.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOVLED, that Allegheny County Council does hereby thank Coro Pittsburgh and the Martin Luther King, Jr. Leadership Award finalists for their work to improve civic life in the Pittsburgh region. Sponsored by Council Members, Sue Means, Tom Baker, Sam DeMarco, Cindy Kirk, Ed Kress and all of County Council, this day, the 17th of January 2017. Congratulations. (Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Yeah, we're going to pass them out. Maybe if each of the finalists maybe wanted to share your favorite thing you're involved with real quickly. I know we've got a busy agenda tonight, but ---. I will say I don't know if there's anyone in our community that brings people better together than Emmai Alaquiva. And once you say it a couple of times it starts flowing, I'll say that. But Emmai brings everyone together. He's got such a great crowd here tonight. I want to start with Emmai. If everyone just wants to share a couple words about what this, being a finalist means to them or what they enjoyed being involved with in the community. And friends of Emmai, where are you guys at?

MR. ALAQUIVA: Well, I just want to say thank you all for being a part of this incredible intersection of my life. A lot of you know my journey and where I've come from. But part of being a leader is recognizing that the individuals around you make you who you are. So I appreciate each and every one of you and also the other awardees. So let's jam next week. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. LIZARONDO: Do you cheer for everyone else, too? On behalf of 412 Food Rescue and everyone else, I am very honored to be part of such an amazing group. As an immigrant to the United States who really didn't know why she was leaving her country and to find meaning finally this year, this is a very personal recognition for me. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: They're into it now, Leah. Dr. Wallace. Dr. John Wallace?

DR. WALLACE: I want to acknowledge and thank Coro, of course, thank County Council and just an amazing opportunity to be recognized with such an esteemed group of colleagues and friends. And go Emmai.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: We'll turn it over now to the better Baker, Erin Baker.

MS. BAKER: You're good. Okay. James Doyle, do you want to go? James Earl Doyle.

MR. DOYLE: Thank you. Just really quickly. Just an honor to be here. Just have random --- from one of the Coro programs that I did, Councilman Baker was my trainer so I really appreciate him and all of Council for this honor. And ultimately, just being able to give back

to our students is something that makes me very happy. So appreciate of that. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Barbara Arroyo is not here so we'll keep it going. 412 Food Rescue ---. Oh, Barbara Arroyo is here. Hi, Barbara, how are you? Congratulations.

MS. ARROYO: Thank you. Hi, everyone. I just want to say thank you so much. I'm truly honored to be here and honored to be a part of such distinguished group of individuals. Thank you, again. I really appreciated it.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: 412 Food Rescue.

MS. ENGLAND: We waste 40 percent of the food we produce in this country while one in seven people go hungry. That is a horrifying fact. 412 Food Rescue bridges that disconnect and comes up with a solution that involved donors, recipients and volunteers. We've got literally hundreds and hundreds of people across this County that make this work. And I just want to thank Council for recognizing us, but I also want to shout out a recognition to all of our volunteers, all of our amazing donors and all of our recipients who do the work every day to make this happen. And to Leah, whose idea it was.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Leah is a double honoree, a double finalist, so that'll be good. Homewood Children's Village, how are you? Come on up. Congratulations.

MR. BROWN: I'd like to thank you for this honor. To the Council, certainly. Honor to be paired with such tremendous workers in the change industry. We've been working with Coro on their co-work project most recently. And it's been a tremendous experience working not only with the staff, but with the youth themselves. I think it speaks to the advocacy and the excellence of the principle that Coro runs with and we try to embody in Homewood. And if I could --- just may, our founding board chair is Dr. John Wallace. If you're looking for impact, you need to look no further than that. Thank you, guys.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Pennsylvania Innocence Project.

MS. DeLosa: Good evening. My name is Liz DeLosa. I'm with the Pennsylvania Innocence Project. On behalf of the project, we just want to extend our gratitude to the Council and obviously to Coro Pittsburgh.

The Innocence Project just opened a new office here in Western Pennsylvania in June. We have been received with open arms by Western Pennsylvania, and we are eager to work with Allegheny County and the surrounding counties to continue to pursue true and equal justice for all. Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Those were our organizational members. And we'll get into our Distinguished Merging Leaders. And Jen, for that how what is the age range on the Distinguished Leader? A little younger; right?

MS. HOLLOWMAN: We were aiming for like 17 to mid-20.

MR. BAKER: So some of our youngest leaders in the community. Great. Hashaam Jamil. You're up first, sir. Did I get it right?

MR. JAMIL: I just want to say thank you to the Council and for Coro Pittsburgh for giving me this opportunity to be with such amazing people up here. And really, thank you for giving me the opportunity that college kids and the University of Pittsburgh students can really make a difference. And I'm glad to be representing them here today.

(Applause.)

MR. BAKER: Nicole Harrington. I think we might be 100 percent on attendance. That's very good.

MS. HARRINGTON: I honestly just want to say thank you to everyone. I appreciate it. I'm happy to be one of the finalist. Can't wait to jam up you guys on the 28th. But thank you so much. I really appreciate it. (Applause.)

MR. BAKER: And Delante? He's not here. We were so close. Congratulations again to all the finalists. Jen Hollowman, is it too late to buy ticket?

MS. HOLLOWMAN: No. You can still get tickets at Coropittsburgh.org. If for some reason, financial

limitations would inhibit you from buying, just let me know and we're happy to make a purchase.

MR. BAKER: Okay. All right. Thank you. And so on behalf of all of Council which all co-sponsored this Proclamation congratulations, thank you for all of your work. I will say this. If you're watching at home or in the crowd, think about getting involved with any of these good folks and the work that they're doing to make our

community better. So one more big round of applause for all of our finalists, and thank you for all you do.

(Applause.)

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9979-17, and the rest will be read into the record.

MR. BARKER: 9979-17. Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2016 Clairton High School Football Team for winning the 2016 WPIAL Class A Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

MR. BARKER: 9980-17. Certificates of Achievements awarded to the 2016 Thomas Jefferson High School Football Team for winning the 2016 WPIAL Class 4A Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

MR. BARKER: 9981-17. Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2016 West Allegheny High School Football Team for winning the 2016 WPIAL Class 5A Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Members Baker and DeMarco.

MR. BARKER: 9982-17. Certificates of Achievement awarded to the 2016 Central Catholic Football Team for winning the 2016 WPIAL Class 6A Football Championship. Sponsored by Council Member Klein.

MR. BARKER: 9983-17. Proclamation congratulating Professor Mark D. Yochum, J.D. upon the occasion of his retirement after 33 years of service with Duquesne University School of Law. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

MR. BARKER: 9984-17. Proclamation congratulating Dr. Joel Fishman, Director of the Duquesne Center for Legal Information and Allegheny County Law Library, upon the occasion of his retirement after more than 40 years of service. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

MR. BARKER: 9985-17. Certificates of Achievement awarded to Michael J. Behr, Lochlann Gilbert, Noah V. Magdich, Nathan P. Mavrich, Michael A. Starkman and Cory J. Supan of Boy Scout Troop 248 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Member DeFazio.

MR. BARKER: 9986-17. Certificate of Achievement awarded to Daniel Antonio DeCaria of Boy Scout Troop 1111 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

MR. BARKER: And 9987-17. Certificates of Achievement awarded to Adam Hoebler and Brandon Hoebler of Boy Scout Troop 296 for earning the rank of Eagle Scout. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public Comment, we have one, Patrick Dowd.

MR. DOWD: Thank you, Council President and members of Council. My name is Patrick Dowd. I'm the Executive Director of Allies for Children, a child advocacy nonprofit here in Allegheny County. I'm a resident of Allegheny County and a parent of six which is, in my opinion, germane for this conversation.

I want to thank you all for the time and consideration that you're providing to the proposed ordinance 9917 --- sorry, 6117, the ordinance proposed related to regulating the use of e-cigarettes here in Allegheny County. I want to thank you for the careful consideration that you all are giving this. I've had the opportunity to talk with almost all of you. Not new member Catena. And I've corresponded with all of you about this ordinance, proposed ordinance.

And I just --- there have been a lot of facts thrown your way over the last few weeks as we've listened to this and we've shared information with you as well. And I just want to sort of say a couple of things about that and encourage you forward in bringing together some experts which many of you have talked to me about.

As I've listened to the arguments in opposition to is ordinance or proposed ordinance there are a number of main threads, but for me the thing that I hear the most is a business concern, a concern about business. We've heard folks basically say they worry about what will happen to the e-cigarette business. They worry about vilifying this. That's a sort of term that's been used. There's concern about --- this ordinance might create disincentive to make a shift from one form of tobacco use to another. It's bad for business. And that it might be inefficient for those folks that use these products if they have to step away from their place of work. And those are important arguments. And I know that you're all considering them carefully. And I'm not here to attack them. What I want to suggest, though, is there are two other areas that are of extreme import and that I want --and I think you're also considering, but I want to highlight tonight.

First is just our right to clean air. We all have a right to clean air. We're in this room --- I used to serve in the City government. If you were to look at pictures over there you would see cigar ashtrays from prior periods. And thank God we don't have to sit through that anymore. And think about other forms of public accommodations and the things that we don't have to deal with any more. And I think we all believe in the right to clean air and that's really what's at base and at heart of this. But for me, as a parent, for me as a former teacher and for me as the executive director for Allies for Children, this is also an important issue for the young people in this country.

I know I'm running out of time, but there's a report that's out from the Surgeon General. It's really important that you take time and bring in some experts. I know you've all talked about that. I want to encourage you to do that so that you can get that information as well on the table and that you can consider it as you further deliberate on this and provide the good thinking that you've been doing on this work. So I just want to encourage you. I'm not exactly sure how your process is, but as I said, many of you have suggested bringing in experts. I want to make sure and encourage you to bring in experts who are particularly focused on the health of young people in this County because that's really for us, the core issue. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. 9988-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the December 6th, 2016 regular meeting of Council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to make a motion?

MR. WALTON: So moved.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Second. Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye. (Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. 9966-17.

MR. BARKER: I'm sorry, 9965-17?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes, I'm sorry. 9965-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Ashley Henry Shook to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Airport Authority for a term to expire on December 31st, 2021. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9966-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Mary E. Gibson, Esquire, to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Human Relations Commission for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9967-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Daniel Styche to serve as a member of the Allegheny County Human Relations Commission for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9968-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the reappointment of Donald Smith to serve as a member of the Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County for a term to expire on May 23rd, 2021. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9969-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Kathi R. Boyle to serve as a member of the Area Agency on Aging Advisory Council for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9970-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Ethel Cobb to serve as a member of the Area Agency on Aging Advisory Council for a term to expire on December 31st, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9971-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Jean Holland, "Holly", V. Dick to serve as a member of the Area Agency on Aging Advisory Council for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9972-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Dr. Emma Lucas-Darby to serve as a member of the Area Agency on Aging Advisory Council for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 9973-17 --- that'll go into Appointment Review Committee. 9973-17.

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Debra Smith to serve as a member of the Area Agency on Aging Council for a term to expire on December 31st, 2020. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Appointment Review Committee. Unfinished Business, seeing none, we'll move on to Liaison Reports. Anybody have a Liaison Report? Go ahead, Representative Ranalli-Russell.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Thank you, Mr. President, for recognizing me. On February 4th, it's a Saturday, it's going to be at Cefalo's Banquet and Event Center in memory of Melissa Bowers who was murdered February 8th, 2012. And I would --- you know, I wanted to let everybody know that this a wonderful event. There are some --- I think, I believe, there's five or six different entertainment things that are going on. And this is also sponsored by a really good friend of mine, and she was good friends with Melissa. So this is in her honor. And all the proceeds go for the Center for Domestic Violence. So thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Where's that at again?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: This is at Cefalo's
Banquet and Event Center, and that's in Carnegie,
Washington Avenue in Carnegie.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And how much is ---?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: And that is from 7:00 to 11:00, Saturday, February 4th.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: And how much is it?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: It's \$20, \$20 at the door.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Any other ---? Okay.

Representative Baker then ---.

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Mr. President. We did have a really good County and City wide event yesterday. I want to thank County Manager McKain for --- these events just don't plan themselves so everyone from the County that helped put that event on yesterday --- the County works with the City as well to put on really terrific rallies for the Steelers. I know, we're here for government, sports is part of that. They really are amazing rallies that bring together hundreds and hundreds of people that care about our team and care about our region. So I want to thank the County, everyone, Manager McKain and his whole team and the County Executive. Amy Downs does a lot of the work in putting those events together so I'm definitely thankful for that.

I want to thank my now not next door neighbor up here, Sam DeMarco for coming out to our Big Brothers Big Sisters kick-off to the year and celebrate Coalitions Event. He was joined by the County Executive, Rich Fitzgerald, and also the new representative, Anita Kulik, so they were both at that event which was great.

And I want to say to everyone one here it's not too late to sign up, February 4th is the next stop on the Allegheny Nine Tour, all those 5ks and 10ks going on in our parks. So this one is at North Park. It's a 10k. It is not a trail run. It's just a regular race. So it's going to be a lot of fun. I'll be there. John Palmiere, are you going to be there?

MR. PALMIERE: If it's not on a Saturday.

MR. BAKER: Oh, it is on a Saturday. We'll see John Palmiere at the next one. Everyone is welcome to run. And it's a good way to get out in the parks, having fun, exercising. They're a really great way to bring our community together.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: I offered to take his customers while ---

MR. BAKER: That's a good offer.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: --- he runs.

MR. BAKER: That's a good offer. Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next we have Mr. Futules, Representative Futules and then you.

MR. FUTULES: Okay. I just want everybody to know that we're all getting revved up and ready for the New England-Pittsburgh game this Sunday. And we should all be rooting for our home team. And hopefully, we can make it to the Super Bowl and win, what is it, seven? Seventh Super Bowl. That would be great. Yeah, the party is at my banquet hall.

Also, I have one more personal thing to say. Today is my mother's 91st birthday.

(Applause.)

MR. FUTULES: And I asked my mother if she knew how old she was and she said she was 99. That's the first time I ever heard a woman say she's older than she really was. So I had to remind her, no, mom, its 91 not 99. Thank you to my mother for being there for me my entire life. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Klein.

MR. KLEIN: This Thursday, the 19th of January at 10:00 a.m., at the Kingsley Center, Commander Gwen Elliott and Walt Harper will be honored posthumously at ten o'clock. The Kingsley's Center is in East Liberty on Frankstown Avenue.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Representative Means.

MS. MEANS: Thank you for recognizing me, Mr. President. On January 28th at 6:00 o'clock, the Bethel Park Historical Society and Bethel Park Recreation will have a Funny Funraiser, so --- it's \$25 a ticket. Again, it starts at 6:00 at the Bethel Park Community. And the comedians' names are Terry Jones, John Evans and Lisa Depridge. And the money goes to --- raised goes to support the recreational fund and also the Bethel Park Historical Society. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Seeing no more hands raised, we'll move on. We're down to 9989-17.

MR. BARKER: Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing the acceptance of the donation of three thoroughbred horses for adoption by the County for use in the Allegheny County Police's Mounted Unit. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to Public Safety Committee. 9990-17.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, extending the grant of a temporary license agreement to Riverlife, in conjunction with Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership, for the purpose of maintaining a light display on the Rachel Caron Bridge, the 9th Street Bridge, in conjunction with the City of Pittsburgh's Bicentennial Celebration known as "Pittsburgh 200" through December 31st, 2018. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go into Public Works Committee. 9991-17.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2017, Submission #07-17. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That'll go to, which one was we on --- 9991 that's Budget and Finance. That'll go to that Committee. 9993-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion of the Council of Allegheny County authorizing the Council of Allegheny County to

conduct a public hearing, pursuant to Article II.G of the Rules of Allegheny County Council on February 6th, 2017, beginning at 5:00 p.m. in the Allegheny County Courthouse Gold Room, located at 436 Grant Street in Pittsburgh, PA. The Council President shall designate a presiding officer for such public hearing. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Councilman Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted everyone to know we're going to vet this situation with the vaping and hopefully everyone can finally come to one of the --- come --- we can all get together and hear both sides of this issue. And that would be a golden opportunity to do that. No pun intended in the Gold Room. And I'm looking forward to having people come in and vet this thing once and for all so we can move on with it. Okay? Thank you, Mr. President.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. Chairman, point of order. PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: You know all the years that I've sat on this Council, we have a propensity to never do anything right, but there's always enough time to do it over. This issue has been called the question in terms of the legality, whether this is a County issue or whether this issue belongs to the State. And I would encourage us to find out the legal issue of this first, whether it is in our purview, before we waste months and months of time and effort and then only to find out that it's not in our purview. So it's just a suggestion. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, I guess we --- yeah, for that meeting --- there's a motion --- we have to make a motion and then pass it and then we should check into that. We'll talk to --- Jack Cambest, maybe you could check in it for us. Do you want to make a motion, John?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes, please.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. He, John made the motion.

MR. DEMARCO: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Yeah.

MR. BAKER: Just one. I think this gets into what former Councilman Dowd was mentioning earlier about, just the importance of having a hearing which I definitely agree with. This may be a question, if that's okay, for Chairman Palmiere, a committee member had. What are we

thinking for the hearing? Are we going to have just people from both sides or ---?

MR. PALMIERE: Yeah.

MR. BAKER: From the public speaking as well or just attending?

MR. PALMIERE: We're going to have experts speaking, addressing both sides of the issue here.

MR. BAKER: Good. I think that's what everyone wants. Sounds perfect.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I would ask if we're going to continue the hearing if you bring some people in here that could test --- the litmus test, whether we should be even voting on this. I mean, I think that's the most important issue at this juncture.

MR. PALMIERE: Well, I'm just following the guidelines that come over from the Chief Executive. They asked me to ---

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, you're ---.

MR. PALMIERE: --- chair this and do this and that's why I --- I have no idea about the legalities of it. You know, if the ---.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Well, the point is --- Mr. Chairman, if you're going to chair the meeting, it's --- you can invite anyone you want whether it be our solicitor's opinion or whether the Chief Executive's solicitor himself. But for us to waste months and months on this to find out if this is not legal is a complete waste of time. I think that that's the most important issue at this point. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Thank you for recognizing me, Mr.
President. I share Council Member Ellenbogen's concerns
about the legality of it. However, I don't see anything
wrong with holding a hearing to help educate the public
and bring experts in from both sides so that we can then
air it in public. And these folks can make up their mind
and learn from that. So I would move forward, from my
perspective, with the hearing that Council Member Palmiere
is looking to do. And if he --- ever is --- the Chairman
of this Committee looks to bring the ordinance for a vote,
than that would be the time to discuss its legal or not.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Right. Okay. Seeing no more questions all those in favor signify by saying aye. (Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. We move down to Notification of Contracts. 9992-17.

MR. BARKER: Communication summarizing approved executive actions from December 1st through December 31st, 2016.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does anybody want to ---? MR. KLEIN: Move and receive and file.

MR. MACEY: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it. Coming down to Public Comment. Okay. Michelle. Go ahead and give your name, Michelle.

MS. NACCARATI-CHAPKIS: Good evening. Thank you for your time this evening. My name is Michelle Naccarati-Chapkis and I am Executive Director of Women for Healthy Environment located here in Pittsburgh.

Our mission is to educate and engage the community using reliable scientific peer-reviewed information about environmental risks that impact the health of individuals and advocate for policy solutions that improve the life of ourselves and our region.

We are here today to address our concerns about the health impacts from e-cigarettes, especially, impacts to those most vulnerable, our children, for whom we are here to have a voice. According to the Surgeon General's office report released on December 8th of just last year, e-cigarettes are now the most commonly used form of tobacco among young people in the United States having surpassed conventional cigarettes in 2014. During the past five years. the number of middle school and high school students who report having used e-cigarettes has tripled. Among young adults ages 18 to 24, the number has doubled. E-cigarettes use grew an astounding 900 percent among high school students from 2011 to 2015. The Surgeon General, Vivek H. Murthy, has stated we know enough right now to say that youth and young adults should not be using e-cigarettes or any other tobacco product for that matter. The key bottom line here is that the science tells us that the use of nicotine-containing products by youth including e-cigarettes is unsafe. We believe children should not be exposed to e-cigarette exposure in public places. Just as they are prevented from exposures from tobacco smoke, the same should be true for e-cigarettes.

A 2014 survey of Southern California high school students indicated that they had smoked or vaped in the last 30 days. And researchers say that they have not seen so many levels of nicotine use among teenagers since 1995 when 12th grade smoking rates were at 19 percent. These numbers suggest that rather than prompting teenagers to replace cigarette smoking with vaping, e-cigarettes instead have enticed an entirely new group of teenagers to use nicotine. While the study focused on California teenagers, researchers say that these numbers are consistent with national trends.

In August in 2016, a publication by a team at Lawrence-Berkley National Laboratory in California showed that the higher e-cigarettes voltage, the more toxic aldehydes it produces in each puff of vapor. Once a certain threshold is hit, each voltage increases, produces a disproportionate increase in acrolein, acetaldehyde and formaldehyde, three of the most harmful compounds in the vapor.

A study published in the <u>Peer Review Journal of Tobacco</u>, control researchers examined the fumes released in e-cigarette liquids with different concentrations of three types of sugars. Testing the vapor for levels of two toxins known as furens which have been linked to an increased risk of respiratory tract damage in humans and tumors in mice. In these lab tests, e-cigarette fumes sometimes released levels of furens that were similar to traditional cigarettes, if not higher, the study found.

I will close with the definition of the precautionary principle. When activity raises the threat of harm to human health or the environment, precautionary measures should be taken even if some cause and effect relationships are not fully established scientifically. Thank you for your consideration of this regulation.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Maria Green.
MS. GREEN: Hello. Thank you for having us
here. My name is Maria Green and I live in Mifflin
Estates. And I'm here to discuss getting our bus service
restored. It's a 210-unit complex and we've been out of
bus service since 2011. A lot of us have had to quit our
jobs, reduced to --- just quit everything, school,
appointments we can't make. And there's a lot of --there's handicapped people up there. A woman and her
cousin just got hit by a truck two years ago trying to
make it Lebanon Church Road. There's no sidewalks. We

really need your help with trying help us get this bus service restored. There's countless stories, and I know I don't speak for myself when I say that just me, myself, I've had countless appointments that I needed to get and I take Access. I just became a survivor of breast surgery, well, breast cancer surgery, and I'm done with radiation, but there's a lot of other appointments that I need to get to that I can't because I have to take Access and it only allows one trip a day. So that means that I'm missing out on other countless of appointments, especially when I was doing radiation. There were so many things I needed to do, but I couldn't get to it. Just like now, we --- most of us up there have to rely on paying someone even to take us just to go get simple food. Appointments for our children are important. My grandchildren --- my daughter works. My grandson has asthma. She can't get Access. They give her a bus --- they give her bus tickets to take my grandson to get --- for his doctor's appointments, but there's no bus service so why give her a bus ticket? She's sitting on bus tickets this thick (indicating). can't get a bus because we don't have service where we live at. So I just --- I live in West Mifflin. And it's like I said, I'm sorry, we just --- it's just a small group of us here today, but we've been working on this for a long time, since last year, to try to get bus service restored. I moved back two years ago from Chicago. a full-time job as a door person. I was resorted to work just two days a week now since there is no bus service. So I just thank you all for listening to us. And once again, my name is Maria Green and I'm speaking from West Mifflin and Mifflin Estates. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Erica Fooks. MS. FOOKS: Good evening. My name is Erica Fooks, of course. I've moved there two years ago and we've --- I just noticed that we didn't have a bus when I got there, when we had moved there, me and my cousin. When I first started moving, catching buses to come to downtown, I would walk all the way to West Mifflin Wal-Mart in the morningtime. There was no sidewalks, so it was --- be careful walking there to make sure I don't get run over by car or anything like that. And I work at Duquesne University. I've been there for like ten years. I also was working there for five days straight, then I would --- now I work three days a week since there's on bus service over there. And also my cousin drives me to

--- back and forth to Wal-Mart so I can get the bus or the Y37 or the Y49 downtown. And sometimes I'll have to call my cousin to actually make sure she can get me from Wal-Mart back to Mifflin Estates. And hopefully, we do get a bus back. I pray and hope that we get a bus back so it don't have to be a disconvenience (sic) for me to also get back and forth to work.

Currently, I don't have any kids, but I would like to have kids soon in my later, future life. Also, it would be nice to --- you know, in the summertime to actually have a bus to actually go to Kennywood, or the zoo or any amusement parks or any parks around the city. Anyway, it's just very hard to get somewhere when you want to go to get groceries or anything else, anything fun around Pittsburgh. And I'm glad that PBT wanted to help us out with getting us the bus back. And hopefully in the situation of the County, they would help us out with the bus service. Also, so everybody else that has kids can also enjoy the weekends or go to school, high school, colleges, whatever have you and enjoy life. And thanks for listening to me. And I hope you take my comments into consideration. Thanks.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Krissy Smith. Krissy not here? We'll move onto Starr Magwood. Starr Magwood, not here. Steven Wilson. Steven ---.

DR. MARTONI: John? John, on the issue of the bus, ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

DR. MARTONI: --- we should send a letter to the Port Authority telling them we have, you know, the need of the people coming to us. They're in control of that, not us, so we should at least ---. Could I ask our audience a question?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

DR. MARTONI: Have you spoke to the Port Authority?

MS. GREEN: Yes. Yes, sir.

DR. MARTONI: Okay.

MS. GREEN: We've been to ---. Do you want me to stand up or ---?

DR. MARTONI: That's good.

MS. GREEN: We've been to meetings and we've also had State Senators and other councilmen come to Mifflin Estates to talk to us. So we're really working on it really hard.

DR. MARTONI: I would be very persistent in that; okay?

MS. GREEN: We're really trying. We haven't stopped and we're not going to stop.

DR. MARTONI: As much as we could sit here and listen to you and feel like we want to do something, they have to do it. We can't.

MS. GREEN: We understand.

DR. MARTONI: Just so you know that.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, let's say this.

MS. GREEN: But in order to get something

done, ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Okay.

MS. GREEN: --- get the busses running.

DR. MARTONI: Just keep on them; okay?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: You could --- we could send

a letter ---. Does anybody on Council disagree with this?

MR. MACEY: No, but Mr. President ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah.

MR. MACEY: --- that's my district and I'm going to be working with these individuals. This is the first I've --- there has been other bussing issues that have been resolved in the district. This is the first I'm aware of it. And I'm going to be working on it on behalf of the Council. I would expect you to give me that respect and work with those people.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Well, that's fine. I mean, do you want us to hold up on the letter or what's your ---?

MR. MACEY: No. I just think that letter is important, but I want to --- I'm going to be meeting with them as soon as their done speaking.

 $\,$  MS. GREEN: We have sent the Council a letter just so you know ---

MR. MACEY: We'll talk.

MS. GREEN: --- what ---.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: What we're going to do is send a letter. All of Council agrees, we're going to send a letter to the Port Authority. That's his district and he wants to work on it personally. He wants an opportunity to let's give him the opportunity.

MS. GREEN: I appreciate it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: So let's see what happens and we'll go from there.

MS. GREEN: Yes, sir.

DR. MARTONI: Keep going down there and make it shake when you come in.

MS. GREEN: Thank you. We will. Thank you.

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Excuse me, are you working with Molly?

MS. GREEN: Yes, ---

MS. RANALLI-RUSSSELL: Okay.

MS. GREEN: --- also.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Let's move on to --- did I ask for Steven Wilson? He's not here. Bill Godshall.

MR. GODSHALL: I'm Bill Godshall, founder and executive director of Smoke Free Pennsylvania.

Back in 2007, ten years ago, I convinced Ryan, the company that invented e-cigarettes in China, to hire Murray Laugesen, a public health physician and founder of Smoke Free New Zealand, to conduct the laboratory studies on their new e-cigarette. In 2008, Laugesen published the world's first study on e-cigarettes which found that they contained the same barely detectible levels of carcinogens and toxins as are found in FDA approved nicotine gums and patches.

Since then, I've been researching, drafting and sending out almost weekly tobacco harm reduction updates to several thousand folks worldwide analyzing vapor product research, policies, proproganda and news stories. For the past two months I've sent these updates to all you County Council Members, and I hope you've had a chance to look at them.

According to the scientific and empirical evidence, vapor products are at least 95 percent less harmful than cigarettes, have helped million of smokers quit smoking, have not created nicotine dependence among known smokers and pose no harm to non-users. Since 2010, US adult smoking rate has declined by 25 percent and the youth smoking rate has plummeted by 50 percent as cigarette sales --- e-cigarettes have taken over a lot of the market.

A 2015 CDC survey found that two and a half million vapers in America including about 10,000 in Allegheny County have quit smoking cigarettes. And that many more vapers have sharply reduced their cigarette consumption.

Each of the following emits more toxins, carcinogens and other indoor air pollutants than an e-cigarette, but nobody is proposing to ban them from work

places. Every time a smoker exhales for an hour after smoking a cigarette; smokers clothes and hair, glues, paints, carpet, furniture, cooking, printers, copiers, cleaning products, dry cleaned clothes, hair sprays, perfumes, nail polish and remover, air fresheners and even a cup of coffee and a cup of tea. Vapers and smokers have a human right to truthful health information and to use lifesaving alternatives to cigarettes. Consistently, public health officials have an ethical duty to truthfully inform the public that vaping is far less harmful than smoking cigarettes and poses no harm to nonusers.

In 2009, an FDA spokesperson accidently committed a gaff by telling the news media, we don't want the public to perceive them as a safer alternative to cigarettes. Since then, Obama's Department of Health and Human Services and many of its funding recipients and big pharma finance groups have falsely claimed that vapor products are target marketed to youth, have addicted millions of youth, are gateways to cigarettes, don't help people quit smoking and may be as harmful as cigarettes for users and non-users.

A recent analysis of a 2014 National Youth Tobacco Survey that was cited by one of the supporters of the bill earlier, found that less than 1 in a 1,000 never smokers, never smoking youth, had reported using e-cigarette ten or more days in the past 30 days. They never found even one non-smoking youth that has become addicted. There's an old saying that if a big lie is --- PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Your time is up.

MS. GODSHALL: --- repeated enough times people will believe it and that's what's been happening. Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Richard Marino.

MR. MARINO: My name is Richard Marino. I'm
here to urge you to reject the Board of Health's proposed
ban on electronic cigarettes. I've been here before. Let
me recap some of the things that I gave you. I gave you a
lot of studies. We gave you three studies last week,
actual studies that you could look at.

The first one was called the Monitoring the Future from the University of Michigan. It was published last month, so it's about as current as you can get. And this survey talks to 40,000 to 50,000 people. And it shows that electronic cigarette usage among teens has decreased, not like what they're saying. Actually, it has

decreased over the last two years, two years consecutively. And not only that, the teens that do use electronic cigarettes don't use any nicotine. I can actually attest to that because I have a store. The 18 and over who we're allowed to sell to now, they pick up no nicotine.

The second study I gave you was the Royal College of Physicians who indicated electronic cigarettes is 95 percent less harmful than traditional cigarettes.

The third one was a study from Drexel University, Dr. Bernstein, that indicates there's no evidence that secondhand vapor causes any harm to anyone. All three of these are credible studies and prove that their information is misinformation and that electronic cigarettes are helpful to people who want to quit smoking.

I gave some practical examples of people who work in high-rises who have now have quit and use electronic cigarettes. I also gave you an example of the Rivers Casino, places --- bars and restaurants as some of you may own. And I also gave you examples where you don't want electronic cigarettes; Children's Hospital, Chucky Cheese, McDonalds. Those are individual places where children are at. That's what these folks are referring to. Why would you --- use common sense. Why would you want a blanket the whole County when there's only specific places? People who manage those facilities can make that decision.

And finally, and probably the most incredible statistic is from the CDC. 1,000 people, 1,000 people die every day from smoking cigarettes. That's the bad news. The good news is that smoking is at an all-time low because of electronic cigarettes. And so many people have quit. I would invite every one of you out to my shop on McKnight Road, and come talk to my customers. Any time you want to come, I'm available. I'll let you meet them one at a time or as they come in my store. You know, we have about anywhere from 70 to 100 people come in every day to each of my shops. I would encourage you to talk to those people. All of you have people who you know, people who have got cancer and maybe in your family, maybe your grandmother, your aunt, your uncle, your neighbor, your cousin. These people want to quit smoking. They can't. So why would you ban the only solution that they have? Please use common sense and reject this proposal. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Marc Conn.

MR. CONN: Hello. And thank you once again for the opportunity to speak to you. My name is Marc Conn. And I've come today once again to ask you to vote against this County-wide indoor vaping ban.

Over the past months you have been given a lot of information, both for and against these regulations. And there seems to be one trend worth noting. When you take the relevant information from the people in support of this regulation, you are left with two main points; the renormalization of smoking for teens and the potentially harmful effects of secondhand vape. And while I have refuted both of these issues in previous meetings, the point I would like to underline today is that these harms are purely theoretical. You have heard about studies that teens who vape have progressed to smoking. And indeed, a multi-year study of 694 teens, six of those, 16 vapers progressed to smoking. And while this seems alarming, 65 of the remaining 675 who were non-vapers also started smoking. The study doesn't show that vaping alone causes teens to start smoking or that those who vaped were not predisposed to smoke in the first place. The harm is theoretical and the connection is weak.

You've also heard a lot of information about the particles in secondhand vape. And as I had discussed in previous meetings, there are problems with the studies and the results given are in a vacuum. There is no actual, proven damage from secondhand vapor. There have been no real world documented cases of anyone being harmed by secondhand vapor. The harms of vaping are only theoretical. When you hear from proponents of this bill what we don't have the long-term studies to prove the harms, ask yourself what the side effects could be of enacting regulations when those harms haven't been proven.

I know that the County Council meeting is probably not the best for an internet mean, but I saw one this week that was very fitting. It said there is more dihydrogen monoxide in your children's juice box than in a pound of methamphetamine. And this is the type of information you've been given. Scary words with no explanation as to why they are important. Upon examination of my comment, dihydrogen monoxide is better known as H2O, water. And it proves that scary words don't mean anything by themselves.

In stark contrast, you have heard from people who actually work in high-rise office buildings explaining the lack of productivity and having to go outside to vape. You have heard from several people, myself included, who have actually quit smoking by vaping. You have heard from actual business owners who deserve the right to make their own vaping policy. And you have heard that 812 of the 842 comments of the Board of Health received were against this regulation. These are not theories or studies, but empirically proven facts.

I believe each establishment should be able to make its own policy, and I support businesses who want to enact and enforce a no-vaping policy. But a one size fits all regulation doesn't make any sense. Look at the mechanics of how someone breaking this law would go and the status quo if you vape inside. A member of the establishment may ask you to stop. If you don't, they may ask you to leave. If you refuse, they'll likely call the police. After this ban is passed, if you vape inside a member of the establishment will ask you to stop. don't they might ask you to leave. And if you refuse, they'll more than likely call the police. The law makes no difference in how the situation is handled. proves that this ban does nothing more than handcuff businesses owner, demonize vaping products and stigmatize vapers, all with no merit or proven harm.

Please protect county business owners and vote no for your constituents. Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to make a motion to adjourn?

MR. DEMARCO: Motion to adjourn.

MR. FUTULES: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

# CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Court Reporter

Sarah Hunt