ALLEGHENY COUNTY COUNCIL

REGULAR MEETING

BEFORE:

John P. DeFazio - President, Council-At-Large
Nicholas Futules - Vice President, District 7
Samuel DeMarco, III - Council-At-Large
Thomas Baker - District 1
Cindy Kirk - District 2
Edward Kress - District 3
Patrick Catena - District 4
Sue Means - District 5
John F. Palmiere - District 6
Dr. Charles J. Martoni - District 8
Robert J. Macey - District 9
DeWitt Walton - District 10
Paul Klein - District 11
James Ellenbogen - District 12
Denise Ranalli-Russell - District 13

Allegheny County Courthouse
Fourth Floor, Gold Room
436 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Tuesday, August 22, 2017 - 5:05 p.m.

SARGENT'S COURT REPORTING SERVICE, INC.
429 Forbes Avenue, Suite 1300
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
(412) 232-3882 FAX (412) 471-8733

IN ATTENDANCE:
Jack Cambest - Solicitor
Jared Barker - Director of Legislative Services
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The meeting will come to order. Will you all rise for the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag and remain standing for silent prayer or reflection?

After me ---.

(Pledge of Allegiance.)
(Silent prayer or reflection.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: We'll have the roll call.

MR. BAKER: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?
MR. CATENA: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Here.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
MS. KIRK: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Klein?
(No response.)
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Present.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Here.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Here.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Here.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Here.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Here.
MR. BARKER: We have 14 members present at the moment.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10260-17.
MR. BARKER: Proclamation congratulating Beth El Congregation of the South Hills upon the occasion of its 100th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Members Catena, Ellenbogen and Means.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Who's ---?
MR. CATENA: I'm presenting. Sorry, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.
MR. CATENA: Good evening, everyone.

We're here tonight for a small ceremony for the Beth El Congregation, celebrating 100 year centennial for them, an outstanding milestone and achievement in any --- whether you're thinking about life in general, or anything that you have to do. It's a tremendous achievement.

And of course, I couldn't be prouder because it's obviously located in my home district. Scott Township is your home, obviously.

But it's a crowning achievement and you should all be proud.

We have a number of guests, obviously, with us this evening. So would you like to come up, Deborah Scheimer? She's going to speak on behalf of the past president and co-chairman, along with Elizabeth --- Aliza Gelb and Alan Scheimer as a member of the Centennial Committee, and we also have some guests.

Beth --- and I'm sorry if I mispronounce your names. Beth Pomerantz, Betty Balk, Lynda Braff, Jeremy Broverman, Aliza Gelb, Bonnie Gordon, Steve Hecht, Miles Kirshner, Jamie Lebovitz, Bryan Neft, Karla Perelstine, Alan Scheimer, Deborah Scheimer, Ralph Schmeltz, Sheila Schmeltz, Susan Seletz and Sylvia Slavkin and Michael Syme.

Did I get them all?
AUDIENCE MEMBER: Yes.
MR. CATENA: Okay.
Very good.

So I'm going to read the proclamation and then I'm going to turn it over to Councilman Ellenbogen and Councilwoman Means to make some further remarks.

WHEREAS, Allegheny County Council
Proclamation ---.

WHEREAS, the Beth El Congregation of the South Hills dates back to 1917 when Rebecca Ruderman and other passionate women formed the Jewish Mothers' Club. This organization's primary purpose was to develop and implement a formal Hebrew curriculum; and

WHEREAS, by 1920, male members began to join the congregation and eventually, they were granted charter to build their first synagogue in Beechview. Over the years,
the Jewish community increased and the demand for a larger synagogue was obviously clear. In 1962, the current synagogue in Scott Township was built to meet the needs of the 400 families and approximately 1,400 family members of the Beth El congregation; and

WHEREAS, the Beth El Congregation of the South Hills, since its founding in 1917, the congregation has been dedicated to growth, adaption and bringing people for all ages and genders together; and

WHEREAS, the Beth El Congregation of the South Hills began a yearlong celebration of its 100th anniversary on May 7th, 2017. This yearlong celebration includes a tribute dinner, picnics, Shabbats, and the culminating event of the centennial, the party of the century, which is scheduled for April 27th and 28th of 2018.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that Allegheny Council does hereby congratulate the Beth El Congregation of the South Hills upon the momentous occasion of its 100th anniversary. We recognize and commend Beth El Congregation of the South Hills for serving the community for over 100 years.

Sponsored by Council Members, myself, Sue Means and Council Member Ellenbogen, and presented this 22nd day of August 2017.

Thank you.

(Applause.)

MS. MEANS: I just want to say congratulations and thank you so much for all you do for the citizens of the South Hills for 100 years. The faith community is so important, as you reach out to help our citizens.

And I want to personally thank you that for the past three years, your church has hosted the special needs workshop with Representative Miller, and how it blesses so many peoples' lives. But I just want to thank you again.

And I also wanted to --- everyone to notice that that the congregation idea was started by a woman with eight children who decided that they needed religious education, so it is a great celebration.

And also, I read in this article that your pastor --- one of your Rabbis are trendsetters, as well, that in your --- your Rabbi Amy was one of the first women to graduate from Seminary. And they're one of the first couples to be --- the very first couple to --- to serve as
a couple. That's exciting. You guys are trendsetters. So thank you for all you do.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Thank you.

MS. MEANS: And of course, 100 years sets a trend.

MR. CATENA: Councilman Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Congratulations on 100 years. That's a wonderful feat considering all the things that have happened in the last 100 years and the work that you folks do is wonderful.

But secretly, I'm here because I want to get you back to Beechview. We're rebuild --- we're rebuilding all of the Broadway quarter. We have the trolley and everything, so give it some thought when --- you know, you don't want to stay in Pat's district.

But I'd like to congratulate everyone and the hard work and the things that you folks do for the community. Congratulations. Thank you.

BETH EL MEMBER: They built the Beechview Carnegie Library. That's where we were.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: We'll tear it down and put you back, if --- we can put the library down where the bar is or something.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Hey, I want the library more.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: We'll just vote it. You're a Beechview guy. You should be up here telling me ---.

MS. SCHEIMER: Hello, my name is Deb Scheimer and I'm a past president of Beth El Congregation as well as a co-chair of our Centennial Committee along with Aliza Gelb and my husband, Alan Scheimer.

On behalf of Beth El, I would like to thank Allegheny County Council and especially Council Members Pat Catena, Jim Ellenbogen and Sue Means, for taking note of our 100th anniversary.

This proclamation is a wonderful and meaningful addition to our celebration. We look forward to sharing it with our members at our congregation-wide event on September 16th, where we will unveil a time capsule from our original synagogue in Beechview, and which contained the original charter document of our congregation.

At the unveiling, we will remember Rebecca Ruderman who recognized a need for Jewish children in Beechview to have a religious education. We will remember that she knocked on doors to enlist the help of other
women to create an organization to provide that education. And we will recall that it took eight years of hard work and sacrifice to raise the funds to erect our first building in Beechview.

Finally, we'll remember the vision and dedication of our members to build a new building in Scott Township, that has enabled our congregation to continue to grow and thrive.

In this centennial year, we recognize that we are not the same as when we started. We've evolved in order to meet the needs of each passing generation and we realize that being open to change has kept our message relevant.

And most importantly, we celebrate the many friendships and meaningful life cycle events that all of us at Beth El have shared together as a congregation and as a family, and we look forward to sharing them in the future.

Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. CATENA: You want some pictures?

MS. SCHEIMER: Yes.

Okay. Into the middle.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Congratulations.

(Pictures taken.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Congratulations.

Okay. 10263-17.

MR. BARKER: Certificate of Recognition congratulating Mrs. Bonita "Bonnie" DiCarlo upon the occasion of her 75th birthday. Sponsored by Council Member Walton and Controller Wagner.

MR. WALTON: Well, I have Jan from Controller --- Controller Wagner's office here that is going to share the --- the presentation of the proclamation --- I mean, the Certificate of Recognition.

Anyone that knows Bonnie DiCarlo knows that, one, she's strong-willed, she's outspoken, she fights for what she believes in and she will you beat you down, you know, if you get in her way.

It is with that kind of --- that spirit and that kind of cognition, that I think that this is a really momentous occasion that we celebrate her life and her history. And I'd like to ask you --- to come up, Bonnie, if you would, and your --- and Joseph, if you'd like to come with her.
MS. DICARLO: Can we all come up?
MR. WALTON: Yeah, absolutely. Bring the whole crew. Bring the whole crew.
Jan --- Jan, why don't you introduce the rest of them?
JAN: We'll let Bonnie do it. It's her family.
MR. WALTON: Yeah. All right. Yeah.
MRS. DICARLO: Thank you, Councilwoman --- yeah, Councilman Walton and Jan and the rest of the council people here.
I'd like to introduce you to my husband, Joe DiCarlo.
MR. WALTON: Hi, how are you?
(Appause.)
MRS. DICARLO: My --- you don't have to clap until I'm done.

So we're here as a family and friends, and we're very, very happy to both Councilman Walton and to Controller Chelsa Wagner for issuing this proclamation.
MR. WALTON: Thank you.
So with that --- with that in mind, we are here to provide this Certificate of Recognition.
This Certificate of Recognition is presented to Ms. Bonita "Bonnie" DiCarlo, of East Liberty, upon the momentous occasion of her 75th birthday.
Ms. DiCarlo was born August 3rd, 1942. As an advocate for peace and justice for all in the Greater Pittsburgh area, she's been an active member of the Thomas Merton Center since its inception in 1972.
Also, in 2002, Ms. DiCarlo became co-founder of Celebrate and Share, an organization that features the achievement of women and raises funds for organizations with a focus on the needs of women and children in the community.
For the past 36 years, she's been employed by Allegheny Investments as a representative and financial planner. During her --- her years at the investment company, Bonita has found time to run for senate --- state senate several times in the 1990s and is still dedicated to public service by helping women run for office throughout the city, county and state.
Bonita is married to the love of her life, Joseph, and together they have a son, Joe, and a daughter, Helene. Ms. DiCarlo is --- is the proud grandmother of two grandchildren, Elijah and Daisy.

We honor Ms. DiCarlo for her longevity, which can be attributed to a positive outlook, and we commend her for taking a proactive approach to life.

This council wishes her and her family all the best as she celebrates her 75th birthday. Sponsored by Allegheny County Council, DeWitt Walton and County Controller Chelsa Wagner, and presented this 22nd day of August 2017.

Bonnie, thank you and --- hey, look here. We look forward ---.

(Applause.)

Thank you so much.

MS. DICARLO: Thank you very much.

MR. WALTON: And then Bonnie ---.

JAN: Many of you don't know, Bonnie and I have been friends for many years. We've been asked to start a consulting firm called Thelma and Louise, and we have spent a good part of our life working for women in elective office, locally and statewide.

I'm proud and honored she doesn't only call me a friend, but a member of her family. And just because she's one year older than me, doesn't let her be the boss all the time.

(Applause.)

MS. DICARLO: Thank you, Jan.

This is really a great honor. I lived long enough, that's what it is, and I'm very happy to be here and happy to be able to continue the work that my family started.

My husband, long-suffering, puts up with me, with all the things that I do, and my friends who are --- who are just --- nobody could ask for nicer, and greater, and more loyal friends and family than I have. So I want to say that the family tradition lives on in me, and in all of my siblings and in my friends.

And I just hope that in the coming years, women will be more recognized than we are right now, that women will be more elected --- I see Audrey clapping --- will be in more elected positions than we are right now. And I believe that everything tells us that if that is true,
things get a lot better, not only with women, but with people of color and with people in minority situations. I believe that it's time for all of us to look out and see what's happening, and to not deny that there is a problem with race relations, and with gender relations, and with ethnic relations. And it's up to each one of us, once we refuse to deny that this is happening, to act and to do something about it.

And I have to say that through my life with my friends and with my family, that this has been able to happen and I'm very happy about that. I'd like to see it continue. And I just ask each one of you to not deny that we have a problem, and to get out there and do something about it.

Thank you.

(Applause.)

MR. WALTON: Let's take pictures.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Congratulations.

(Pictures taken.)

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10264-17, and the rest will be read into the record.


10265-17. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. John Henne upon the momentous occasion of being inducted into the 2017 Retail Hall of Fame in the Single-Store Independent category. Sponsored by Council Member Kress.

10266-17. Proclamation congratulating Saint John’s Lutheran Church of Perrysville upon the occasion of its 150th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Members Baker and Kirk.

10267-17. Proclamation recognizing and commending the students who successfully completed the 2017 Municipal Internship, a program sponsored by the Local Government Academy. Sponsored by Council Members Martoni, Baker, Catena, DeFazio, DeMarco, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kirk, Klein, Kress, Means, Palmiere, Ranalli-Russell and Walton.

10268-17. Certificate of Recognition recognizing Carrick High School Class of 1967 upon the
monumental occasion of their 50th anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Ellenbogen.

10269-17. Proclamation celebrating the 125th anniversary of the Borough of Port Vue in Allegheny County that was held on Saturday, July 29th, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Macey.

10270-17. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Dr. Sheila L. Johnson for her outstanding musical contributions on a local, national and international level over the past 30 years. Sponsored by Council Member Martoni.


10272-17. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. and Mrs. George and Barbara Morgan upon the occasion of their 54th wedding anniversary. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

10273-17. Proclamation celebrating the 125th anniversary of the Borough of Turtle Creek in Allegheny County that was held on Saturday, August 19th, 2017. Sponsored by Council Member Martoni.

10274-17. Certificate of Recognition awarded to Mr. Steve Kienzl upon the occasion of refereeing for 50 years at local softball, baseball, football and basketball games. Sponsored by Council Member Palmiere.

And 10275-17. Proclamation recognizing the StarKist and Dongwon Company for their annual luncheon honoring all those who served in the Korean War from Western Pennsylvania on August 22nd, 2017. Sponsored by Council Members Means, DeMarco, Walton, Baker, Catena, DeFazio, Ellenbogen, Futules, Kirk, Klein, Kress, Macey, Martoni, Palmiere and Ranalli-Russell.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Public comment, we don't have any?

MR. BARKER: Not on agenda items, no.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Approval of minutes, 10256-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the June 6th, 2017 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

10257-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the June 20th, 2017 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

DR. MARTONI: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

10258-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the July 5th, 2017 regular meeting of Council.

MR. MACEY: So moved.

DR. MARTONI: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

10259-17.

MR. BARKER: Motion to approve the minutes of the July 11th, 2017 regular meeting of Council.

MR. DEMARCO: Motion --- motion to approve.

MR. PALMIERE: Second.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

Presentation of appointments. 10276-17 (sic).

MR. BARKER: Approving the appointment of Margaret McCormick Barron to serve as a member of the Redevelopment Authority of Allegheny County for a term to expire on May 23rd, 2019. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: That will go to the Appointment Review Committee.

Unfinished business, Committee on Budget and Finance, second reading, 10237-17.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution of the County of Allegheny amending the Grants and Special Accounts Budget for 2017, Submission #08-17. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: The Chairman, Klein, isn't here. Someone at that meeting, do we want to --- someone
want to make a motion or --- anyone that was at that
meeting?

MR. PALMIERE: That met with an affirmative
recommendation, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Does someone want to make
the motion, then?

MR. PALMIERE: I'd like to make a motion, yes.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none,
we'll take the roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELENBOGEN: Aye.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 14, nos zero. The bill

passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10238-17.

MR. BARKER: A Resolution ratifying certain
year-end transfers pursuant to Section 805.03 of the
Administrative Code. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.
MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah, go ahead.

MR. PALMIERE: I was at that meeting and that also met with an affirmative recommendation and I make a --- a motion to approve.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take a roll --- roll call.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?

MR. BAKER: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?

MR. CATENA: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?

MR. DEMARCO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellenbogen?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?

MS. KIRK: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?

MR. KRESS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?

MR. MACEY: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?

DR. MARTONI: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?

MS. MEANS: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?

MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?

MR. WALTON: Yes.

MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.

MR. BARKER: Ayes 14, nos zero. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: 10216-17.

MR. BARKER: An Ordinance authorizing the County of Allegheny to sell a 12,301.8 square foot parcel of excess vacant parcel of land, located on the northeasterly side of Summit Street, 200 feet west of westerly right-of-way line of Boyle Avenue, situated in the 8th Ward, City of McKeesport, tax parcel No. 461-A-164, for
the fair market value amount of $4,300, to McKeesport Alliance Church. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Macey?
MR. MACEY: Thank you, Mr. President and members of council. The Committee on Public Works met on August the 17th and we discussed this at length and it was sent to the full council with affirmative recommendation.

I make a motion that we accept the ordinance.
(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, we'll take the roll.

MR. BARKER: Mr. Baker?
MR. BAKER: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Catena?
MR. CATENA: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Ellerbogen?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Aye.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Futules?
MR. FUTULES: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Kirk?
MS. KIRK: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Kress?
MR. KRESS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Macey?
MR. MACEY: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Martoni?
DR. MARTONI: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Means?
MS. MEANS: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Palmiere?
MR. PALMIERE: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ms. Ranalli-Russell?
MS. RANALLI-RUSSELL: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Mr. Walton?
MR. WALTON: Yes.
MR. BARKER: President DeFazio?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes.
MR. BARKER: Ayes 14, nos zero. The bill passes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Liaison reports.

Representative DeMarco?
MR. DEMARCO: Thank you, President DeFazio.
In July, I was part of a group. All the county commissioners in Pennsylvania were invited to go to Washington for a meeting and meet with representatives of the federal government.

And what they're doing is they've taken and put staffers in each agency of the federal government, to allow specifically, to work with us at the county level, to ensure that we're able to resolve problems and things like that, for our constituents.

So we heard presentations from every department in the federal government, with the exception of the Department of Defense, including folks like NASA who talked about three astronauts from Pennsylvania. The Department of Energy briefed us and talked about what they do out here at South Park and the investments they've made.

So we've come back and we have names, e-mail addresses, phone numbers for these representatives to assist any of us here on county council, in taking and resolving problems for our constituents. And I've been told that they will be having more of these things in the future, so I highly recommend and urge some of my colleagues, if you get the opportunity, to take and attend.

Thank you, Mr. President.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Representative Palmiere was next.

MR. PALMIERE: Thank you, Mr. President. I just wanted to give a shout out to the Department of Public Works. I talked to Mr. Shanley, the director, a month or so ago, about Schuette Road down there in Baldwin that was hit real bad with the floods, and we lost part of the road. Part of the --- part of the road collapsed and --- and the wall.

And Steve assured me it would be ready in three weeks, because that's a main artery down there in that area. And it was done in three weeks and I just wanted --- I want to give him a --- you know, really, really commend him and his --- his staff for getting that done.

Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Representative Walton?

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Mr. President. What I'm about to say is very near and dear to me. Over the past couple of weeks, America has undergone a really dark
period with the events in Charlottesville, with the activities in a variety of cities, with marches by neo-Nazis, the Ku Klux Klan, has really struck fear into my heart. I'm really afraid for our country, and I'm really concerned about Pittsburgh.

Just a week ago, less than a week ago, there were comments and conversations about neo-Nazis and organizations, white nationalist organizations having a march, on Google, and potentially putting hundreds, if not thousands, of lives at risk.

I think that I believe that the elected leadership in this city and this county are insightful, thoughtful men and women, and we cannot allow those kinds of activities to occur unfettered in our community.

We have --- we, as a nation, we faced a --- we face a host of challenges, and it's going to take progressive, thoughtful leadership, caring kind of commitment to engage in behaviors that bring out the best in America and not the worst in America.

And I ask everyone to follow a comment that Bonnie DiCarlo made earlier. Folks have to stand up and be counted. Folks have to stand up and say this is not what we allow in our communities. This is not what we allow in our communities. And I ask each of you to be thoughtful, to be caring, and --- and to do the right thing.

Thank you, sir.
(Applause.)
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Anyone ---?
MR. ELLENBOGEN: Mr. President?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yeah. Representative Ellenbogen was next.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: Thank you, Mr. President and members of council.

I wanted to --- and this is very difficult for me, but I want to mark the passing of former Councilman Bern Erb, who passed away on Friday. He was a former, actually, republican councilman from Monroeville, and he was a dear friend.

To his wife Laura and his children, Max and Sophia, I --- there's a lot --- I know members of council wish them the best in the future and blessings.

Bern was an interesting kind of guy, you know. He wasn't the kind of guy that politicians liked because when it came to his faith, that always came first. So me
being a Democrat and him being a Republican, I've seen him battle more than once, but he never compromised who he was. He never compromised his faith.

I mean, this was a man that traveled to Africa to spend a couple months there to try to help people.

He will sorely be missed by myself and I'd like to wish his family the best.

And as a matter of fact, when I was sick a couple years ago, he was the guy that trained me every day. Whether it was five degrees or whether it was raining, he would drag me out in the street, you know, to walk or run, or do what we had to do, and I will miss him terribly.

Thank you, Mr. President and members of council.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Wait a minute. I think --- was that Baker --- Representative Baker?

MR. BAKER: Thanks, Mr. President. I just wanted to let everyone know our third annual town hall for district one went well last week. Thanks to Councilwoman Kirk and Councilman DeMarco for coming out.

We had some great guest speakers. Ken Varhola, our new Chief of Staff, spoke and shared with a lot of elected officials and community leaders at --- both of those events, which was a big help, certainly.

We also were joined by Senator Reschenthaler, Senator Vulakovich and Representative Kulik at the town halls, which was great to have their state perspective as well, so that's been a nice tradition we've had. We had about 40 --- a little over 40 at the Moon one and a little over 25 at the one in --- in Ross Township.

North Fayette and Findlay Township both had great community days. Congratulations to them.

Councilman DeMarco and I did a joint table again --- again, this year, for the North Fayette Community Day, which was great.

We also called numbers out together, which was a lot of fun. Sam's very good at calling bingo numbers out. We called them out at the senior center in North Fayette. He was --- he did get yelled at once or twice, actually, but in general, he was --- he was excellent at it. He really did get yelled at, actually. But it was --- we had a good time doing that. A lot of the seniors from district one come to those and we definitely appreciate that.
Commissioner Betkowski and I both were at an opioid hearing from the crime prevention group in Ross Township. The Ross Township Police Department and the commissioners did a great job putting that on. I would recommend for all of my 14 colleagues and anyone watching, anyone here, the Attorney General's Office did a really good job putting that together.

There was maybe 20 or so people there that night. We all learned a ton. I would encourage everyone to consider reaching out. You reach out to us and we can put you in touch with the Attorney General's Office and the folks that --- that presented that. It was really interesting, really helpful, so I would be happy to do that.

And finally, as I think everyone knows, I just wanted to say thanks. You've all been so nice. Erin and I are expecting our first kid, so Cindy Kirk gave me some good reading, so I've got the Expectant Father and What to Expect When Your Wife is Expecting.

(Applause.)

So thanks very much for all your nice messages and I'm lucky to have you all as friends. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Futules?

MR. FUTULES: Yeah, I could tell you what to expect. I told him before the meeting, he should have started saving for their college education five years ago. That was one of my advice to him.

But for the event that just happened yesterday, of course, we're all very aware of the eclipse. It was a great event for --- I hope that people around here got the opportunity to look at the sun through special glasses, like I did. My son acquired them when he was down at Kitty Hawk. NASA gave him a pair.

It's the first time I ever saw the eclipse through those glasses. It was quite an event, and --- and I think that it's a great opportunity for us. In 2024, this will be a total eclipse here in Pennsylvania. I know I'm speaking early, but it would be a great idea for us to utilize the opportunity in the State of Pennsylvania and Allegheny County.

I've seen Oregon and Charleston, South Carolina, places like that. We saw pictures on the news where there were fields of motor homes and campers, people coming in
from all over the country just to see, in certain states, the eclipse.

So it's a great opportunity for visitors to come to Pennsylvania for this, in the year 2024. I realize I'm a little early, but --- and hopefully, we'll all be here in 2024. But if you wait until the last minute, you don't get things done.

MS. KIRK: You've got to get the glasses.

MR. FUTULES: And --- and that's another thing, there really wasn't easily --- to get those glasses. You just couldn't go to specific stores and go buy them or purchase them anywhere. So I --- I think that there's an opportunity there for someone to utilize the fact that --- to see the sun through those glasses, is --- what a great opportunity that was, because you just can't look up at the sun. We know that. And it was a great event.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Means?

MS. MEANS: Thank you, Mr. President, for recognizing me.

I wanted to add to what Councilman Futules said. I actually am one of those people that drove to Nashville, Tennessee to see the total solar eclipse. And it --- and it was truly amazing, but the traffic jam trying to come back was also truly amazing.

But it was --- it was --- but you can buy welder's glasses, as long as they're 12 grade --- grade 12 or above, and so I actually wore welders glasses so that I could see the total eclipse.

But it was amazing. The streetlights came on. It got very dark outside and the cicadas thought it was nighttime. They started chirping. And it was --- it was beautiful. It was a very beautiful and wonderful event that people should plan for in the future. Seven years will go quickly.

And so thank --- thank you for recognizing me.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

MR. PALMIERE: Mr. President, I just want to know, how did Mr. Baker have time to do anything else? He's so busy doing everything else. Congratulations.

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I always say he's never home. I guess he got home.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. Hold up, hold up, hold up. 10276-17.
MR. BARKER: An Ordinance of the County of Allegheny, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, authorizing Townsquare Live Events, LLC to use the outdoor space adjacent to and behind the structure known as the Amphitheatre in the County's Hartwood Acres Park to conduct an event entitled the Glow Jack-O-Lantern Experience. Sponsored by the Chief Executive.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Representative Palmiere, do you want to say anything on that?

MR. PALMIERE: Yeah. Mr. President, we ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I'll just put it in Parks.

MR. PALMIERE: --- made an attempt last year and --- and they had the --- they had some kind of problems and we had to negate that. But this year, they're --- they're trying to do it again, so we're going to have a committee meeting and make sure we get this done.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: In Parks, yeah.

MR. PALMIERE: Yes.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right.

MR. PALMIERE: Okay? Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Good. All right. Also, new business. Representative Walton?

MR. WALTON: Thank you, Mr. President.

I'd like to take this opportunity. Members of council have already had the opportunity to meet our new Chief of Staff, Kenneth Varhola, and I'd like to take the opportunity to present him to the community-at-large and all of our constituents.

Ken, would you come and --- Ken is new. He has been on board for a little less than a month, now, right at a month. And we're really pleased to have him to lead our staff, and to help continue the development of the county council office and we're really pleased to have you on board. And with that (adjusts microphone) ---.

MR. VARHOLA: Thanks, Councilman Walton. Thanks to all the members of council.

I appreciate this opportunity, but I --- this is not my job to be up here and be known by the public. I'm here to represent and work for all of you as hard as I can, with the rest of the staff. So I --- I appreciate the recognition, but thank you very much. And I'm just looking forward to getting back to the office tomorrow with staff, to do what you all need us to do.
So thank you very much for your --- for this opportunity and for your trust and faith in me, and I appreciate that.

Thank you very much. Thanks.

(Applause.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: DeWitt, do you want to make a motion ---?

MR. WALTON: Yes, thank you. John, thank you.

I need help sometimes.

I would like to move that we --- that we formally extend a hiring offer to Ken Varhola, to add him to our --- to --- wait a minute. Let me back that up.

I move that council approves the --- on the final hiring of Ken Varhola to become the Chief of Staff for county council.

(Chorus of seconds.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Under remarks?

Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MR. FUTULES: Mr. President? Mr. President?

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Yes?

MR. FUTULES: May I ---? Mr. Varhola, now that you're hired, that's your seat right there, not over there (indicating).

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. We have no --- 102, what is it, 77-17?

MR. BARKER: Communication summarizing approved Executive Actions from July 1st through July 31st, 2017.

MR. MACEY: Receive and file.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Someone want to second that?

MR. ELLENBOGEN: I second it.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks? Seeing none, all those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

Public comment, do you want to start off ---?

MR. BARKER: We have several on non-agenda items. First up is Lester Ludwig.

MR. FUTULES: He's not here.

MR. BARKER: Next up is Audrey Glickman.


Do you remember reading about DEFCON last month, where they hacked voting machines like we use in
Pennsylvania, and reading how the Russians are sticking their noses and electronics into our elections, too? And the tests that we do on the machines that are like the tests that they do on Volkswagens --- useless.

Citizens are shouting for security. The general public understands and initiatives are everywhere except here in this room where we can do something about it.

The lack of security has been widely discussed by many experts far and wide and right here, officially and on the record. Councilman Robinson's legislation set aside money for this purpose years ago.

We don't know the software running on our voting machines. No one here does. We already do know it's corrupt from the beginning, and we simply trust it. Testing before each election whether the software on a few machines hasn't changed is not sufficient, especially if the software was bad to begin with.

Yet, we have the County Executive getting on statewide radio proclaiming that paper ballots used now in 17 Commonwealth counties are illegal in Pennsylvania, that it would take a wrench and a hammer to hack our machines, that because there's no evidence of something wrong, there is nothing wrong.

The Post Gazette says that county officials know what they're doing, yet Fitzgerald's words, not to mention our elections division choosing to send county tax money to Spain to create an elections return website to a company that specializes in unsecure voting systems, do not reassure us. And when we speak, no one seems to be listening. What's the point of anyone saying that we're wrong?

Vote Allegheny has plenty of information and links on our website. They're written by experts. They're reported in highly regarded journals and they're investigated and written in mainstream media. All of it collectively says that we should be voting on paper ballots, securely cast, collected, audited and recountable. We should have done this from the beginning. And anyone who says it's illegal in Pennsylvania has not been paying attention.

DEFCON has put the public on heightened awareness. We and our colleagues have been working on this for over a decade and we applaud DEFCON and all the states and counties that have changed. We want better,
safer, more secure, more accessible elections. Why wouldn't you do this?

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Thank you. Next?

MR. BARKER: Michele Zuckerman-Parker.

MS. ZUCKERMAN-PARKER: Hello. I am Michele Zuckerman-Parker. I reside at 813 South Braddock Avenue in Pittsburgh.

Each child who's born in this county is entitled the opportunity to thrive and enjoy a quality of life equal to that of other children born, regardless of their ZIP Code. We know our current system of political systems only serves a few, and we demand equity for all legally.

For over 30 years, I have documented the difference between students who thrive and those who operate in survival mode. Enough is enough.

We know what the issues are. There are --- there's no more need for research. We must take action. I have diligently worked to increase access to quality education for students and their teachers because there is a difference between equality and equity.

Based on this work, I created donttreadonme.com because I firmly believe the best way to address the inherent institutional racism in our nation is to provide access to quality learning opportunities for all.

To achieve that goal, we must revitalize the entire election process. Although the effort originated in Allegheny County to address specific election integrity issues, the program was designed to be iterative and replicable.

We've been contact by various states and other counties around the nation. They're looking for us for guidance.

It is the opinion of the county solicitor, which is now being challenged in the Court of Common Pleas, that the Home Rule prohibits citizens from petitioning on behalf of the election process. We are here today because the work continues to amend the Home Rule because it serves a few, rather than all.

Democracy is iterative by design and we have the tools to improve it now. Now is the time to use the will of the people. We, the people, demand authentication of election integrity for the entire process. We must fight for the right to vote, especially for those who have paid their debt to society, to reform education, or healthcare,
or address gun rights or electric cars, each citizen must be engaged in the election process.

Our government, the elected officials who legislate on our behalf, must reflect the composition of its constituents.

On November 27th, 310 affidavits were submitted on behalf of 310 residents in Allegheny County. These citizens requested a forensic analysis of the 2016 general election. The result was not an authentic forensic analysis because there's no mechanism in place to do so.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Next?

MR. BARKER: Ronald Bandes.

MR. BANDES: Hi, Ron Bandes, 1531 South Negley Avenue, Pittsburgh district 11.

As the president of Vote Allegheny, a nonpartisan election integrity organization, I'd like to address the trustworthiness of the computers our county uses to record and count the votes.

My expertise is information security. For the last seven years in my work after hours, I've been focused on the county's election security issues.

One year ago, the director of the Department of Elections in this county told the Tribune Review that our voting system is unhackable. The problem with our voting systems isn't just vulnerability to hacking. All software has flaws.

In elections, such flaws have produced disastrous results, such as lost votes that couldn't be recovered. We must be able to verify that our voting systems behave properly to have trustworthy elections that the citizens can respect.

Not even the best security expert or election official can prove or demonstrate with a test before the election that the systems can't be hacked. Tests do not foretell the future. They just tell you if the recommended defenses are properly in place.

The Trib reported that each test is designed to check a potential breach in the system. This is patently false. The largest set of tests performed by the county is the logic and accuracy test. It has nothing to do with security, just that it counts votes accurately under test conditions.

Remember the recent Volkswagen scandal? The cars could tell when they were being tested. The cars
behaved one way during regulatory tests and another way when on the road. Can a voting machine software tell when it's being tested? Yes, and it might be as simple as checking the date, which they certainly can do.

Is it election day? Not a test. Not election day? It is a test. We're told everything is tested extensively before the election, after election and on election day. Not so.

The logic and accuracy test is the only test that is applied to all the machines, and it is not a security test. The firmware verification and parallel tests are performed on a tiny sample of the voting machines, and not everything is tested.

For example, the machine's logs are not examined after the election to see if unexplained things occurred. Since tests cannot foretell the future, we need to examine the voting machines and ballots after the election. The ballots must be examined in an audit in which the machine tabulation of the ballots is compared to the voters' original intent.

The audit only has meaning if we actually can know what was the original intent of the voters. We can't do that with choices stored in computer memory that were never directly observed and verified by voters. We can do that by sampling voter-marked paper ballots, as these ballots can be reexamined and interpreted by humans.

There's no way to verify whether our voting systems currently in use are accurately reflecting the voters' choices from the top to the bottom of the ballot. Let's replace these aging 11-year-old machines with something verifiable, to be able to assure voters and candidates that the reported results are highly accurate.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Next?

MR. BARKER: Michele Feingold.

MS. FEINGOLD: Michele Feingold, 6343 Crombie Street, Pittsburgh, 15217.

In a healthy democracy, there can sometimes be legitimate debate and disagreement. But in other cases, there are only undeniable truths and indisputable facts.

Perhaps, at some point there was room to question whether or not our electronic voting machines were unacceptably vulnerable to hacking. This summer, reasonable people, true patriots and ethical politicians
of any political persuasion can no longer legitimately argue the point.

How can you credibly argue against the establishment of a commission to safeguard the integrity of the vote in Allegheny County? If you ever could, you no longer can.

In June, a US Department of Homeland Security official told Congress that Russian hackers had targeted 21 US state election systems in the 2016 presidential race, and that a small number were breached. According to Fortune Magazine, there was no evidence that any votes were manipulated.

However, the problem with paperless machines is precisely that we can't know if they were hacked because it's impossible to know if the electronic tabulation of the votes was manipulated by software bugs or viruses or by malware inserted by nations, political parties, insiders or hackers.

Regardless of your take on the Russian hacking of US election systems, regardless, even, of your interest in the Russians hacking our elections, all doubt about the security of electronic voting machines was laid to rest in late July of this year.

For the first time, the annual DEFCON Hacking Convention in Las Vegas included a so-called hacker voting village to raise awareness about the threat of election results being altered through hacking. It took computer hackers less than two hours to break into some 30 US voting machines --- less than two hours.

According to Barbara Simon (sic), who is an expert in --- a computer expert and voting expert, we are told not to worry because these machines are secure since they were never connected to the internet. But even if the machines are isolated from the internet, election information is uploaded to those voting machines from digital memory devices. Those devices are initialized using computers that typically are connected to the internet at some time. It takes only a fraction of a second for the --- a computer to be infected with a malicious virus. Once a computer is infected, the memory devices also can be infected and they, in turn, can infect voting machines.

Jack (sic) Braun, CEO of security consulting firm, Cambridge Global Advisors, and one of the organizers of the hacker voting village, says there's been a lot of
claims that our election system is unhackable. That's BS. Only a fool or liar would try to claim that their database or machine was unhackable. Without question, our voting systems are weak and susceptible.

Please heed his words, engage the experts and find our count a secure, verifiable, recountable, accessible and unhackable election system.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next?
MR. BARKER: Christine Allen?
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Next?
MR. BARKER: Brian Gardner.
MR. GARDNER: So apparently, I timed it this way.

Hi, y'all. My parents are Bethel Park High School sweethearts. I lived here from 1997 to 2004. I, at the time, backed this random upstart named Bill Peduto, for city council. And after that, I graduated from Pitt with an MBA and went to San Francisco, where I've been for the past couple years.

I've recently re-come back. I boomeranged. So I'm a returnee to Castle Shannon, so I am now a native Pittsburgher once again.

In San Francisco, once I arrived in about 2004, we fought a very similar right. In San Francisco, we have a bunch of tech people, you might have heard, and they were all very up in arms about exactly how hackable all the machines are.

It's not a question about whether they can be hacked. It's not a question --- because that's known that they can be. It's a question about whether people have the will to hack them.

And in 2004, it might have been an open question about whether somebody had the will to hack our election systems or not. But we live in 2017 now, and it's not a question. We know that, at least, Russia wants to hack the elections and at least Russia has tried.

And as long as we know that people are trying to do it and as long as we know that it's possible, then it's unconscionable as far I can --- can concern (sic) in a democracy, to not do something to try to stop it. It's a battle I fought in San Francisco and it's a battle I came home to.

It seems to me that unfortunately, it's possible. And I'm still new, so I don't know, but it's
possible some --- there's some personality politics going on involved in this --- in this issue. This is not a personality issue. This is an election integrity issue. This is about whether peoples' votes actually get counted or not, and the only way to verify that is through some sort of secondary measure like a paper trail. And to not even look into the system and to not investigate, is to not believe in democracy, as far as I'm concerned, and that's something that I care about very much.

I care about protecting everybody's vote. I care about protecting the votes of the people I adamantly am completely opposed to. We need to look at our election system and make sure that there are ways to recount it, and there are ways to ensure that the people who voted were tabulated the way that they voted.

Obviously, I rushed here from childcare. I'm sure for being here late. I'm going to go sit down and be quiet now. If she makes noise, we'll have to leave early. I apologize for that.

Thank you for your time.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Thank you. Next?

MR. BARKER: Last up is David Tessitor.

MR. TESSITOR: Good evening. My name is David Tessitor, City of Pittsburgh.

Just got back from seeing the eclipse and do you know that eclipse has been going on before our species and yet human beings believed we were in a flat earth? There were people who pointed out, no, there's lunar eclipses that show that it's a round earth, et cetera. And yet very respectable people at the highest level said, no, this is a flat earth. And this went on for a long, long time, until eventually, it hit them in the face and they finally had to admit to it.

Well, that's what's been happening now with our election system here in Allegheny County and the State of Pennsylvania. We've been watching the Flat Earth Society say we don't have to worry. It's a flat earth. Well, that isn't necessarily true.

I'm the person who wrote the ordinance that was supposed to be before you right now that would have given you an opportunity to have an expert commission look at this, to give you the best and optimum system that this county could have, at the most reasonable price, that would be workable and that treat disabled people well.
Unfortunately, your solicitor said, oh, we can't do that. Well, you know, in 2006, you guys did it. Now this council may be different members. Some of you are the same. You did it in 2006, you could do it now. Yeah, you could.

And it's also in the law that you could put on the ballot a question of whether we should have new machines, and that if that question was approved by the referendum of the people, would have the force of law. And yes, the Board of Elections would have to comply with that, and that's the way.

Yes, the Board of Elections does do the conductive elections, but it is trumped by state law which says specifically that voters have the right to choose the means of election, and our constitution of Pennsylvania protects that.

We are before council now, explaining this to you, we are also before the courts. And I just got a note from my attorney that is handling the appeal of the rejection, that on --- let's see, it's October 22nd --- let's see, September 22nd is when the briefs will be due by your side, the solicitors. October 13th is our side and October 20th will be the hearing before Judge James on whether to allow an ordinance which provides for the best system of making sure we have good, qualified voting can come before you.

But you don't have to wait. There are appropriations that have to move in order to make this happen. You don't have to wait. You have the ability, as a council. That isn't the Board of Elections that does appropriations.

Thank you.

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay.

Let's see here. We have executive session --- should we --- should we take a recess and come back?

MR. BARKER: Actually, that structure is a meeting ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Pardon me?

MR. BARKER: --- of the executive committee ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: I didn't hear you.

MR. BARKER: --- at six o'clock. That's a --- that's a meeting of the executive committee, Mr. Walton's committee, at six o'clock, so ---

PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Okay. Then ---.

MR. BARKER: --- it's not a session, it's ---
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right.
MR. BARKER: --- a committee meeting.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: All right. We're down to adjournment. Someone want to make a motion to adjourn?
MR. WALTON: So moved.
MR. MACEY: Second.
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Under remarks --- we don't have no remarks. All those in favor signify by saying aye.

(Chorus of ayes.)
PRESIDENT DEFAZIO: Opposed? The ayes have it.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:08 P.M.
CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were taken stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

Jeremy Harris,
Court Reporter